

Brunswick City Planning Commission

November 16, 2017 – Caucus

7:00 p.m.

John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Brian Ousley, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Dev. Director

As Chairman Shirilla and Vice Chairman Arona were unable to attend, Recording Secretary John Rocha called the meeting to order at 7:08 p.m.

The first item was the review of the discussion plan for the Conrad's Tire Express & Car Care expansion, 4340 Center Road. Mr. Jones commented there is a 21' aisle width and bollards, which is going to make it a tight fit for maneuverability on the site.

Mr. Ousley noted there is a 4' to 5' elevation change on the west side of the property and inquired if there will be a retaining wall. Mr. Jones stated he is concerned about insufficient room for the refuse trucks to maneuver on the site.

Mr. Hasan stated he counted 27 spaces on the property, instead of 28, as mentioned in the Staff Report. He said he will confirm the amount of spaces with the applicant. Ms. Plavecski explained if there are only 27 spaces, a modification will not be required, as it will comply with the maximum number of parking spaces allowed.

Mr. Rocha adjourned the meeting at 7:26 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

Brunswick City Planning Commission

November 16, 2017

7:30 p.m.

John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Brian Ousley, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Dev. Director
Pat Tumino, Conrad's Tire Express & Car Care, 14575 Lorain
Avenue, Cleveland
Rob Miller, Davison Smith Certo Architects, 26031B Center Ridge
Road, Westlake
Sam Jakabec, Davison Smith Certo Architects, same

Item 1

Recording Secretary John Rocha called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m.

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO EXCUSE CHAIRMAN SHIRILLA AND VICE CHAIRMAN ARONA FOR JUST CAUSE.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays.

Ms. Plavecski called the roll; 3 present, 2 absent (Mr. Shirilla and Mr. Arona).

MR. SAEGER MOTIONED TO APPOINT JOHN ROCHA AS TEMPORARY ACTING CHAIRMAN FOR TONIGHT'S MEETING, AS THE CHAIRMAN AND VICE CHAIRMAN ARE NOT PRESENT.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 2

There were no announcements or correspondence.

Item 3

MR. SAEGER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FROM NOVEMBER 2, 2017.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 4

Regarding the revised discussion plan for the Conrad's Tire Express & Car Care addition, Mr. Pat Tumino, owner; and Mr. Rob Miller and Mr. Sam Jakabec, of Davison Smith Certo Architects, were present.

Mr. Jakabec gave an overview of the project. Mr. Rocha inquired about the grade differential where the parking is located and the tight turning radius mentioned by Mr. Jones in tonight's caucus meeting. Mr. Jakabec explained customers do not pull their cars into the facility; that is done by employees. He said their store in Strongsville also has limited space and they are accustomed to dealing with this situation. Regarding the trash service pick-up, they will schedule service before the business is open so there will not be any vehicles in the way.

The applicant addressed the Staff Review Comments as follows:

1. The 844 sq. ft. addition extends approximately 9' into the 25' rear yard setback required by Section 1260.05(c) at the southwest corner of the site. In the course of exercising its site plan review powers under Chapter 1278, the Planning Commission, pursuant to Section 1244.04(b)(1), may in specific cases, with the consent of City Council, and upon proper written applications, vary or permit exceptions to any of the provisions of Chapter 1260 (General Commercial District) if the Commission expressly finds that both (1) such variance or exception will not violate the spirit or intent of the Chapter, and (2) that a more harmonious and compatible development will result. In order to grant a variance, a public hearing will be required when the detailed site plan and conditional zoning certificate are submitted, pursuant to Section 6.02(c)(1) of the City's Charter.

Mr. Jones commented there is a grade differential by the edge of the paving on the west side of the property and inquired if a retaining wall or a fence will be installed.

2. The applicant verified there are 27 parking spaces, which complies with the maximum number of spaces permitted by Table 1276-1(d)(7). Mr. Rocha commented that two handicap spaces are required; one of which must be van-accessible, pursuant to Table 1106.1 of the 2017 Ohio Building Code, to which the applicant agreed. He noted that Mr. Incorvaia previously stated in the caucus meeting that the ten spaces in the shared parking lot to the south of Conrad's do not count toward the number of spaces on the site. Section 1276.09(b) allows parking spaces to be located within 500' of commercial and industrial uses, but shall not be permitted in residential districts. Mr. Rocha stated the applicant must obtain a lease agreement with the owner of the shared parking lot, to which Mr. Jakabec replied they have one in place.

Mr. Hasan asked what takes place in the rear of the building; Mr. Jakabec responded they use this for a staging area. Mr. Incorvaia commented no outdoor storage is permitted, to which Mr. Jakabec agreed.

3. As required by Section 1282.08(b), the detailed site plan shall indicate a minimum of 560 sq. ft. of interior landscaping (20 sq. ft. per parking space) to be designed with a minimum of two trees from Plant List "A" and sixteen shrubs from Plant Lists "D" or "E". Mr. Tumino explained they have no room to install interior landscaping and would be seeking a modification, pursuant to Section 1282.10(a). He noted, however, to the east, there is city-owned land by the clock tower which has some old bushes they could remove and then replant with new shrubs. Ms. Plavecski asked Mr. Incorvaia if this is permitted on city property, to which he responded there would need to be an agreement with the city to do so. Mr. Hasan suggested the applicant could clean up the landscaping on their property, to which Mr. Jakabec agreed. Mr. Saeger suggested the applicant should check with John Piepsney, Parks and Recreation Director, to see if cleaning up the city property is an option.
4. The 180 sq. ft. resin board dumpster enclosure has been relocated on the property, but is now encroaching into the 25' rear setback required by Section 1260.05(c) at the southwest corner of the property. As stated in Item 1 of the Staff Review Comments, the Planning Commission, in accordance with Section 1244.04(b)(1), and subject to City Council approval, may grant a variance to the dumpster enclosure setback. Additionally, Section 1276.12(a) states the dumpster enclosure shall be constructed of materials comparable to the building. Mr. Jakabec provided a photo of the current dumpster and said whatever they construct for an enclosure, it will be an improvement. Mr. Saeger stated the dumpster enclosure should match the building, as no hardship has been presented yet.

Mr. Incorvaia reiterated that no tires can be stored outside. Mr. Tumino explained they may have to move the dumpster enclosure if the adjacent property owner adds on to their building, as the Fire Department requires a minimum 15' setback of the structure from the property line. Mr. Tumino noted if they build a masonry dumpster enclosure, it would be difficult to relocate, but they are not opposed to constructing a masonry enclosure. Mr. Incorvaia stated the Planning Commission cannot grant a modification to the type of building material for the dumpster enclosure; Section 1276.12(a) requires the enclosure to be constructed of materials comparable to the building. Mr. Aungst clarified the applicant is aware they need a variance for dumpster enclosure location, but the Fire Department was comfortable with the applicant erecting the structure 15' from the west property line.
5. A color rendering of the building shall be submitted with the detailed site plan to ensure compatibility with the existing structure, as required by Section 1278.08(e). Mr. Saeger stated he would also like to see a color rendering of the dumpster enclosure included with the detailed site plan, to which the applicant agreed. Mr. Hasan suggested adding lighting elements on the east elevation of the building, as it is poorly illuminated on that section of the building.

6. A photometrics plan shall be submitted with the detailed site plan to ensure there is a minimum 0.6 footcandle lighting level for parking and pedestrian areas, pursuant to Section 1276.14(a).
7. Mr. Jones said dimensions for the parking stalls and parking aisle width shall be provided; Table 1276-3 requires 9' wide x 19' long dimensions for 90° angle parking and a minimum aisle width of 24'.
8. Mr. Jones commented the applicant needs to identify on the site plan where the existing paving is and the location of the new pavement being added. He said if a retaining wall is required, the location and elevation need to be shown on the plan. He said drainage and grading also need to be included.
9. Mr. Jones stated if more than 1/10 acre of hard surface area is being added, stormwater retention will be required.

Mr. Tumino said they will be upgrading their signage, to which Ms. Plavecski commented the Building Department will review any changes being made.

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO MOVE THE REVISED DISCUSSION PLAN TO A DETAILED SITE PLAN FOR THE CONRAD'S TIRE EXPRESS & CAR CARE ADDITION, 4340 CENTER ROAD, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING:

1. THE 844 SQ. FT. ADDITION EXTENDS APPROXIMATELY 9' INTO THE 25' REAR YARD SETBACK REQUIRED BY SECTION 1260.05(c) AT THE SOUTHWEST CORNER OF THE SITE. IN THE COURSE OF EXERCISING ITS SITE PLAN REVIEW POWERS UNDER CHAPTER 1278, THE PLANNING COMMISSION, PURSUANT TO SECTION 1244.04(b)(1), MAY IN SPECIFIC CASES, WITH THE CONSENT OF CITY COUNCIL, AND UPON PROPER WRITTEN APPLICATIONS, VARY OR PERMIT EXCEPTIONS TO ANY OF THE PROVISIONS OF CHAPTER 1260 (GENERAL COMMERCIAL DISTRICT) IF THE COMMISSION EXPRESSLY FINDS THAT BOTH (1) SUCH VARIANCE OR EXCEPTION WILL NOT VIOLATE THE SPIRIT OR INTENT OF THE CHAPTER, AND (2) THAT A MORE HARMONIOUS AND COMPATIBLE DEVELOPMENT WILL RESULT. IN ORDER TO GRANT A VARIANCE, A PUBLIC HEARING WILL BE REQUIRED WHEN THE DETAILED SITE PLAN AND CONDITIONAL ZONING CERTIFICATE ARE SUBMITTED, PURSUANT TO SECTION 6.02(c)(1) OF THE CITY'S CHARTER.
2. THE APPLICANT HAS VERIFIED THERE ARE 27 PARKING SPACES, WHICH COMPLIES WITH THE MAXIMUM NUMBER OF SPACES PERMITTED BY TABLE 1276-1(d)(7). TWO HANDICAP SPACES ARE REQUIRED; ONE OF WHICH MUST BE VAN-ACCESSIBLE, PURSUANT TO TABLE 1106.1 OF THE 2017 OHIO BUILDING CODE.
3. AS REQUIRED BY SECTION 1282.08(b), A MINIMUM OF 560 SQ. FT. OF INTERIOR LANDSCAPING WITH A MINIMUM OF TWO TREES FROM PLANT LIST

“A” AND SIXTEEN SHRUBS FROM PLANT LISTS “D” OR “E” SHALL BE PROVIDED. AS THIS IS A SMALL EXISTING SITE, THE APPLICANT WILL BE SEEKING A MODIFICATION, PURSUANT TO SECTION 1282.10(a), WHEN THE DETAILED SITE PLAN IS REVIEWED. IN EXCHANGE FOR NOT PROVIDING INTERIOR LANDSCAPING, THE APPLICANT WILL CONSULT WITH THE CITY’S PARK AND RECREATION DIRECTOR TO DISCUSS REMOVAL OF OLD SHRUBS ON CITY PROPERTY LOCATED TO THE EAST OF CONRAD’S AND REPLANT WITH NEW STOCK. IF THE CITY IS NOT IN AGREEMENT WITH THIS, THE APPLICANT SHALL REFRESH THE LANDSCAPING ON CONRAD’S PROPERTY.

4. THE 180 SQ. FT. RESIN BOARD DUMPSTER ENCLOSURE IS ENCROACHING INTO THE 25' REAR SETBACK REQUIRED BY SECTION 1260.05(c) AT THE SOUTHWEST CORNER OF THE PROPERTY. AS STATED IN ITEM 1 OF THE STAFF REVIEW COMMENTS, THE PLANNING COMMISSION, IN ACCORDANCE WITH SECTION 1244.04(b)(1), AND SUBJECT TO CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL, MAY GRANT A VARIANCE TO THE DUMPSTER ENCLOSURE SETBACK. ADDITIONALLY, THE DUMPSTER ENCLOSURE SHALL BE CONSTRUCTED OF MATERIALS COMPARABLE TO THE BUILDING, PURSUANT TO SECTION 1276.12(a).
5. A COLOR RENDERING OF THE BUILDING SHALL BE SUBMITTED WITH THE DETAILED SITE PLAN TO ENSURE COMPATIBILITY WITH THE EXISTING STRUCTURE, AS REQUIRED BY SECTION 1278.08(e). THE COLOR RENDERING SHALL ALSO INCLUDE THE DUMPSTER ENCLOSURE. LIGHTING ELEMENTS SHALL BE ADDED ON THE EAST ELEVATION OF THE BUILDING, AS THERE IS INSUFFICIENT ILLUMINATION ON THAT PORTION OF THE STRUCTURE.
6. A PHOTOMETRICS PLAN SHALL BE SUBMITTED WITH THE DETAILED SITE PLAN TO ENSURE THERE IS A MINIMUM 0.6 FOOTCANDLE LIGHTING LEVEL FOR PARKING AND PEDESTRIAN AREAS, PURSUANT TO SECTION 1276.14(a).
7. DIMENSIONS FOR THE PARKING STALLS AND PARKING AISLE WIDTH SHALL BE PROVIDED; TABLE 1276-3 REQUIRES 9' WIDE X 19' LONG DIMENSIONS FOR 90° ANGLE PARKING AND A MINIMUM AISLE WIDTH OF 24'.
8. IDENTIFY ON THE DETAILED SITE PLAN WHERE THE EXISTING PAVING IS AND THE LOCATION OF THE NEW PAVEMENT BEING ADDED. IF A RETAINING WALL IS REQUIRED, THE LOCATION AND ELEVATION SHALL BE SHOWN ON THE PLAN. AN EXISTING CONDITIONS PLAN SHALL ALSO BE PROVIDED, ALONG WITH DRAINAGE AND GRADING.
9. IF MORE THAN 1/10 ACRE OF HARD SURFACE AREA IS BEING ADDED, STORMWATER RETENTION WILL BE REQUIRED.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 5

There was no old business.

Item 6

Regarding new business, discussion of the Planning Commission's 2018 Meeting Schedule was held.

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO ADOPT THE 2018 PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING SCHEDULE.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 7

No one appeared at the public comment period.

Item 8

Mr. Ousley stated there was no Council Representative's Report at this time.

MR. SAEGER MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:17 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

November 16, 2017

Conrad's Tire Express & Car Care addition

(Revised discussion plan)

Location: 4340 Center Road
C-G District

Proposed Use & Background:

A revised discussion plan has been submitted for the Conrad's Tire Express & Car Care addition following the application being denied at the Planning Commission's June 1, 2017 meeting, due to the applicant's failure to appear.

The addition is located approximately 21' from the west property line. Although there is no minimum side yard setback stipulated in Section 1260 of the Zoning Code for commercial property adjacent to another commercial property, the Ohio Fire Code requires 30' between commercial buildings if the structure does not have a sprinkler system and 15' separation if a sprinkler system is in place. If any improvements are proposed on the adjacent property, they shall comply with the above Ohio Fire Code side yard setbacks.

Regarding the building façade, the west elevation will match the existing structure with the use of new brick veneer on 8" concrete masonry units (CMU) and matching overhead doors. A new man-door is also shown on this elevation. The north elevation will include a new standing seam metal roof with double rows of snow cleats in "Interstate Blue". The existing metal mansard will be removed and replaced with EIFS.

Staff Review Comments:

1. The 844 sq. ft. addition (reduced from 2,215 sq. ft. original size) extends approximately 9' into the 25' rear yard setback required by Section 1260.05(c) at the southwest corner of the site. In the course of exercising its site plan review powers under Chapter 1278, the Planning Commission, pursuant to Section 1244.04(b)(1), may in specific cases, with the consent of City Council, and upon proper written applications, vary or permit exceptions to any of the provisions of Chapter 1260 (General Commercial District) if the Commission expressly finds that both (1) such variance or exception will not violate the spirit or intent of the Chapter, and (2) that a more harmonious and compatible development will result. In order to grant a variance, a public hearing will be required when the detailed site plan and conditional zoning certificate are submitted, pursuant to Section 6.02(c)(1) of the City's Charter.
2. Four new service bays are proposed, for a total of 9 bays. Table 1276-1(d)(7) requires a minimum of 18 spaces (2 spaces per bay) and maximum of 27 spaces (3 spaces per bay); 28 spaces are shown on the plan, including one handicap space. Table 1106.1 of the 2017 Ohio Building Code requires a minimum of two handicap spaces, one of

which shall be van accessible. Additionally, Conrad's will be leasing ten spaces in the shared parking lot to the south of their building for employee parking, due to the high volume of business on their existing site. Section 1276.09(b) allows parking spaces to be located within 500' of commercial and industrial uses, but shall not be permitted in residential districts. Pursuant to Section 1276.15(b), the Planning Commission may modify the specific standards of this Chapter and approve less restrictive parking or site design improvements in individual, unique situations where such standards are clearly inapplicable. In modifying any requirement of this Chapter, the Commission shall find that the objectives of this Chapter, as stated in Section 1276.01, will be met, that the intent of the specific requirement will be maintained, and that the public interest will be served. The concurring vote of three members of the Planning Commission shall be required to approve a less restrictive improvement as authorized by this subsection.

3. As required by Section 1282.08(b), the detailed site plan shall indicate a minimum of 560 sq. ft. of interior landscaping (20 sq. ft. per parking space) to be designed with a minimum of two trees from Plant List "A" and sixteen shrubs from Plant Lists "D" or "E". As this is a small existing site, the Planning Commission, pursuant to Section 1282.10(a), may approve a less restrictive landscaping or screening improvement in individual, unique situations where the requirements of this Chapter are clearly inapplicable. In approving less restrictive requirements, the Commission shall find that the purpose of the Chapter, as stated in Section 1282.01, will be met, that the intent of the specific requirement will be maintained, and that the public interest shall be served. The concurring vote of three members of the Planning Commission shall be required to modify any of the specific requirements of this Chapter.
4. The 180 sq. ft. resin board dumpster enclosure has been relocated on the property, but is now encroaching into the 25' rear setback required by Section 1260.05(c) at the southwest corner of the property. As stated in Item 1 of the Staff Review Comments, the Planning Commission, in accordance with Section 1244.04(b)(1), and subject to City Council approval, may grant a variance to the dumpster enclosure setback. Additionally, Section 1276.12(a) states the dumpster enclosure shall be constructed of materials comparable to the building.
5. A color rendering of the building shall be submitted to ensure compatibility with the existing structure, as required by Section 1278.08(e).
6. A photometrics plan shall be submitted with the detailed site plan to ensure there is a minimum 0.6 footcandle lighting level for parking and pedestrian areas, pursuant to Section 1276.14(a).
7. Dimensions for the parking stalls and parking aisle width shall be provided; Table 1276-3 requires 9' wide x 19' long dimensions for 90° angle parking and a minimum aisle width of 24'.

8. Identify on the site plan where the existing paving is and the location of the new pavement being added.
9. If more than 1/10 acre of hard surface area is being added, stormwater retention will be required.

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends moving the discussion plan to a detailed site plan and public hearing, pending the Planning Commission's ruling on the above variances and modifications.