Brunswick City Planning Commission

June 21, 2018 - Caucus

7:00 p.m.

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Joe Delsanter, Council Representative
Melissa Bukowski, Chagrin Valley Engineering
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Dev. Director
Frank Biller, Sanctus LLC, 10940 Parker Road, Parker, CO
Becky Andrews, Withers Design Group, 1250 Chambers Road, Columbus
Jason Kouvaris, Five Star Gymnastics, 2773 Nationwide Parkway, Brunswick
Christina Schmitz, Sixmo Architects, 28045 Clemens Road, Suite D, Westlake

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 7:10 p.m.

The first item was the review of the revised discussion plan for Five Star Gymnastics, 994 West 130th Street. Mr. Arona suggested adding enhancements on the south elevation, since it is steel paneling from roof to grade. As future building expansion will occur on the south elevation, Councilman Delsanter suggested adding landscaping to screen the metal paneling. Mr. Hasan concurred and suggested planting a landscape triangle near the south property line by the residential home.

The second item was the review of the revised discussion plan for Sanctus LLC senior development and rezoning, north of Keller-Hanna Drive, south of St. Ambrose Church; and east of Keller water towers. Ms. Plavecski explained the applicant is now seeking to develop the property as a Special Planning District instead of the previously proposed S-R Senior Residence District. Councilman Delsanter commented the residents on Keller-Hanna Drive need to be protected from intrusive structures. Mr. Aungst noted this is a medically-based development.

Mr. Shirilla adjourned the meeting at 7:35 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

Brunswick City Planning Commission

June 21, 2018

7:30 p.m.

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Joe Delsanter, Council Representative
Melissa Bukowski, Chagrin Valley Engineering
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Dev. Director
Frank Biller, Sanctus LLC, 10940 Parker Road, Parker, CO
Becky Andrews, Withers Design Group, 1250 Chambers Road, Columbus
Walter Withers, Withers Design Group, same as above
Jason Kouvaris, Five Star Gymnastics, 2773 Nationwide Parkway, Brunswick
Christina Schmitz, Sixmo Architects, 28045 Clemens Road, Suite D, Westlake
Ken Flesse, Mid American Construction, 8506 Lake Avenue, Cleveland
Doug White,119 Main Street, Hudson
Richard Kassouf, New Hope Realty, 4092 Tudor Avenue, Brunswick
Roger Nair, 5533 Winter Brook Drive, Valley City
Keith & Sarah Zimmerman, 1166 Blueberry Hill Drive, Brunswick
Stacy Nugent, 515 Ridge Road, Hinckley

Item 1

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 7:42 p.m.

Ms. Plavecski called the roll: 5 Present 0 Absent.

Item 2

Regarding announcements or correspondence, Ms. Plavecski announced that Melissa Bukowski, Chagrin Valley Engineering, will be filling in for Matt Jones, City Engineer.

Item 3

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF JUNE 7, 2018.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 4(a)

Regarding the revised discussion plan for Five Star Gymnastics, 994 West 130th Street, Mr. Jason Kouvaris, owner; Ms. Christina Schmitz, Sixmo Architects; and Mr Ken Flesse, Mid American Construction, were present.

The Staff Review Comments were addressed as follows:

1. A photometrics plan shall be submitted with the detailed site plan to ensure there is a minimum 0.6 footcandle lighting level for parking and pedestrian areas, pursuant to Section 1276.14(a).

2. The location of the ground sign is indicated on Sheet A1.0 near the corner of West 130th Street and Carquest Drive. Ms. Schmitz stated she will measure the sign to scale to confirm the sign is not located within 50' of the intersection, in accordance with Section 1270.04(b).

3. Mr. Flesse stated that both the northern and southern gravel drives on West 130th Street have been eliminated; there will be no curb cuts on that street. He commented that a row of landscaping has been added along the east (West 130th Street) property line.

4. Mr. Flesse noted they have eliminated the two parking spaces near the northwest corner of the building in order to provide Fire Department access. He stated the number of parking spaces has been revised to 66 spaces. As required by the Fire Department, Ms. Schmitz stated a minimum 20' wide access way has been provided on the west side of the building.

5. The Fire Department is requesting for turf re-enforcement to be installed on the west side of the addition to allow for emergency vehicle access; Ms. Schmitz stated they will provide this.

6. The sidewalk extending from the existing house to the parking lot on the east side of the new facility ends in front of a parking space. This parking space should be eliminated and pedestrian access should be defined by means of striping, pursuant to Section 1278.09(d)(1); this is shown on the revised plan submitted tonight.

Mr. Shirilla commented Ms. Bukowski stated during the caucus meeting that the proposed retention basin may be too small; Mr. Flesse said it can be enlarged towards the south.

Mr. Shirilla inquired about the function of the decorative metal panels; Mr. Flesse responded this is a type of metal panel that looks like a window, but is used to eliminate sun glare for the students as a safety precaution.

Mr. Arona inquired about the metal siding on the south and west elevations extending from the roof line to grade level. Mr. Flesse stated using this material is the most economical and effective way to handle the future expansion on the south elevation. He noted after the building is expanded, they could add architectural enhancements. Mr. Hasan asked about the façade on the west elevation; Mr. Flesse replied they are using a vertical metal panel system, which is the same type used on the north and east elevations.

Mr. Hasan suggested adding landscaping near the south property line to provide screening from West 130th Street and for the single family dwelling, to which Mr. Flesse agreed.

MR. ARONA MOTIONED TO MOVE THE REVISED DISCUSSION PLAN TO A DETAILED SITE PLAN FOR FIVE STAR GYMNASTICS, 994 WEST 130TH STREET. THE APPLICANT HAS COMPLIED WITH ITEMS 1 THROUGH 7 FROM THE INITIAL MAY 17, 2018 SUBMITTAL. THE APPLICANT WILL COMPLY WITH STAFF REVIEW COMMENTS 1 THROUGH 6. REGARDING ITEM 3, BOTH DRIVEWAYS ARE BEING REMOVED ON WEST 130TH STREET. AS THE SOUTH FAÇADE OF THE BUILDING HAS LIMITED ARCHITECTURAL FEATURES, THE APPLICANT HAS AGREED TO ADD LANDSCAPING ALONG THE SOUTH PROPERTY LINE TO PROVIDE SCREENING FROM WEST 130TH STREET AND FOR THE SINGLE FAMILY HOME.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 4(b)

Concerning the discussion plan for the Sanctus LLC senior development and rezoning, north of Keller-Hanna Drive; south of St. Ambrose Church; and east of Keller water towers, Mr. Frank Biller, owner; and Ms. Becky Andrews and Mr. Walter Withers, of Wither Design Group, were present.

Ms. Plavecski commented the project was originally proposed to be rezoned to the S-R Senior Residence District; however, the owner has now requested the property to be developed as a Special Planning District (SPD).

Ms. Andrews explained as numerous variances would be required if the property was developed under the S-R Senior Residence District, after meeting with the City Administration, the owner decided it would be better to rezone the property to a SPD.

Ms. Andrews addressed the Staff Review Comments as follows:

1. Section 1288.06(d)(1) states multi-family buildings with central hallways shall have a maximum of 60 units per building; the assisted living facility has 80 units and the

attached memory care structure has 32 units, for a total of 112 units. A variance of 52 units will be required from the Board of Zoning Appeals. This variance would be unnecessary, as this would be addressed in the SPD Design Guidelines.

2. Section 1288.05(b)((1) and (2) require a minimum of 650 sq. ft. for each one bedroom dwelling unit, and 120 sq. ft. for each additional bedroom. The applicant has stated the independent living cottages will comply with these amounts. However, the assisted living units are proposed at 450 sq. ft. and the memory care units are proposed at 325 sq. ft. Variances would also be necessary from the BZA, but would be eliminated if addressed in the SPD Design Guidelines.

3. Section 1288.03 states principally permitted uses in the S-R District are apartments and other attached multi-family or detached dwellings, but does not list memory care or assisted living facilities. Pursuant to Section 1280.01(b), the Planning Commission, with City Council approval, shall have the power to permit any use comparable in character to any of the specified uses listed under the principally permitted uses, permitted accessory uses, or conditionally permitted uses section of any district. The above uses would be listed in the SPD Design Guidelines.

4. Ms. Andrews submitted a revised site plan to the Planning Commission which shows a 25' entrance drive width; this complies with the minimum 20' width required by Table 1276-4. An easement will be required from the City of Brunswick, as the entrance drive is located on property owned by the City. She stated all other drives will have a 22' width.

5. Stormwater management is indicated at the southeast corner of the site.

6. A new paved traffic circulation route, pursuant to Section 1276.10(c), is shown to connect Alice Avenue and Ganyard Avenue on the east side of the site for emergency vehicle access, which will include a 100' turn-around. An easement will be required from St. Ambrose Church, as a portion of the connection is on their property.

7. The east drive will be gated to allow for emergency vehicle access only. Residents, employees, and visitors are not permitted to use this drive.

8. They have provided 10 visitor parking spaces for the independent living units. Parking spaces will measure 9' wide x 19' long with a 24' aisle width, in compliance with Table 1276-3. Additionally, a minimum of one van-accessible handicap space shall be designated for the memory care facility and a minimum of two handicap spaces (one van-accessible) shall be shown for the assisted living building, in accordance with Table 1106.1 of the 2017 Ohio Building Code.

9. A minimum 4' wide sidewalk has been added along one side of the street in the independent living units which will extend to the sidewalk east of the assisted living

facility, pursuant to Section 1278.09(d)(1) and (2), which requires safe pedestrian connections between buildings and parking areas.

10. Private open space of 60 sq. ft. will be provided for the independent living units, as required by Section 1288.07(d). However, there is a notation on the plan that offering individual private open space for the assisted living and memory care units would be a safety concern. Therefore, a 4,045 sq. ft. secured patio will be installed on the west side of the assisted living building and a 2,146 sq. ft. secured patio will be constructed on the north side of the memory care facility, for a total of 6,191 sq. ft. A calculation of 112 units (80 assisted living units + 32 memory care units) x 60 sq. ft. = 6,720 sq. ft. The Planning Commission shall determine if this is sufficient.

11. The dumpster will be located behind the assisted living facility near the north property line, and the enclosure constructed of materials comparable to the building, pursuant to Section 1276.12(a).

12. A hard surface access loop on the north side of the site with a 100' turn-around for emergency vehicle access has been provided between the assisted living facility and the memory care building.

Ms. Andrews stated they will work with the City of Cleveland and the Medina County Sanitary Engineer regarding water and sanitary line connections. Concerning refuse pick-up, she stated there is a door-to-door service provided for the independent living cottages.

Ms. Andrews noted a firewall is required between the assisted living building and the memory care facility, and the independent living units will be developed under the Ohio Residential Code. She stated the use group classification will be I-1, condition 2 with NFPA 13 sprinklers. She commented there may be a shuttle service that will pick up residents in the independent living cottages and take them to activities in the assisted living and memory care facilities.

Pursuant to Section 1268.01, Mr. Shirilla asked why the applicant feels this development meets the criteria of a SPD. Ms. Andrews responded there is major topography sloping and wetlands on the site. She said the S-R District is designed for independent living, whereas this project is more of a medical campus with the assisted living and memory care buildings.

Mr. Hasan commented the size of the rooms for the memory care units and assisted living units seems small; Ms. Andrews said for safety reasons, the memory care units need to be small so the nurses can check on the patients. Ms. Andrews noted the proposed size of the above rooms meets the industry standards. Mr. Shirilla stated he is also concerned about the size of the assisted living rooms. He said he would like to see the type of amenities proposed for interaction between the residents of the independent living units with those in the assisted living and memory care units.

Councilman Delsanter commented the Planning Commission and City Council will be looking at aesthetics, safety, the developer's track record, and if sprinklers for the independent living units will be provided.

Mr. Shirilla noted this project is similar to The Athenian in North Royalton, which does not have sufficient connectivity and walkability.

Mr. Incorvaia explained rezoning to a SPD is not a quick process; the Design Guidelines need to be reviewed by the City Administration, Planning Commission, and City Council.

Ms. Plavecski noted there is only a 15' building setback from the north property line and the dumpster is located within that setback, which is not permitted by Code. Mr. Incorvaia explained this property is zoned R-L; therefore, a 50' setback is required.

Ms. Andrews asked for the project to be tabled.

MR. SAEGER MOTIONED, AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST, TO TABLE THE SANCTUS LLC SENIOR DEVELOPMENT AND REZONING, NORTH OF KELLER-HANNA DRIVE; SOUTH OF ST. AMBROSE CHURCH; AND EAST OF KELLER WATER TOWERS.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 5

There was no old business.

Item 6

There was no new business.

Item 7

Mr. Rich Kassouf, of New Hope Realty, appeared at the public comment period. He thanked the Planning Commission for doing a good job.

Mr. Aungst noted the Planning Commission will be reviewing the Brunswick Middle School discussion plan at their July 19, 2018 meeting. He asked if the Commission would like Superintendent Mike Mayell to come to their July 5, 2018 meeting with any pre-meeting questions; Mr. Shirilla responded no, as he doesn't have a site plan yet.

Item 8

Councilman Delsanter stated there was no Council Representative's Report at this time, as the Comprehensive Plan Update is still in progress.

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING.

Mr. Arona seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:52 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

June 21, 2018

Five Star Gymnastics
(Revised discussion plan)

Location: 994 West 130th Street
I-L District

Proposed Use & Background:
At the applicant's request, the Planning Commission tabled the discussion plan at their meeting on May 17, 2018, as further revisions were required.

Comments from the above meeting have been addressed as follows:

1. Section 1278.08(e) requires that within the applicable zoning district, the height, scale and setback of each building should be compatible with existing or purposed adjoining buildings. Architectural style should not necessarily duplicate adjoining structures, but should be compatible in overall form, texture, color and rhythm. Compatibility can be enhanced by the use of building materials and roof lines comparable to near-by development.

   The Planning Commission requested additional architectural elements on the north and east elevations. Therefore, a color rendering of the facility has been submitted indicating the building will be constructed with white vertical metal panels accented with blue horizontal metal panels around the entrance on the north elevation and secondary entrance and overhead door on the east elevation. The window pattern has been adjusted on the north elevation to provide uniformity and windows have been added on the east elevation to break up the long expanse of blank wall, pursuant to Section 1278.08(c). A vertical band of split-face block has been added on the corners of the east and north elevations extending from the top of the structure to grade, as requested by the Commission.

2. The revised site plan indicates the parking space dimensions are 9' wide x 19' long, with a minimum aisle width of 24', pursuant to Table 1276-3 for 90° angle parking.

3. A 5' wide sidewalk leading from the new building to the northern parking lot and to Carquest Drive is indicated on the site plan. Furthermore, a sidewalk has been added from the east parking lot to the existing house, pursuant to Section 1278.09(d)(1). The Commission agreed at the May 17th meeting that a sidewalk will not be required along West 130th Street.

4. A notation has been added to Sheet A1.0 that a minimum of 5% of the total front yard area will be landscaped with trees, shrubs, planting beds, and/or perennial borders and beds in a design selected by the owner, as required by Section 1282.06(f).

5. The applicant stated at the May 17th meeting that the building will be sprinkled, as requested by the Fire Department.

6. The City Engineer requested at the May 17th meeting that the southern driveway near the existing house on West 130th Street should be closed to prevent this being used by parents as a drop-off point. The applicant has chosen to close the northern drive instead, which is satisfactory with the City Engineer.

7. As requested by the Administration, the number of parking spaces has been increased from 50 to 70 spaces.

Staff Review Comments:

1. A photometrics plan shall be submitted with the detailed site plan to ensure there is a minimum 0.6 footcandle lighting level for parking and pedestrian areas, pursuant to Section 1276.14(a).

2. The location of the ground sign is indicated on Sheet A1.0 near the corner of West 130th Street and Carquest Drive. Verify the sign is not located within 50' of the intersection, in accordance with Section 1270.04(b).

3. If the southern gravel drive on West 130th Street will remain, Section 1276.10(c) requires it to be paved. Indicate the new paved driveway width at the right-of-way and curb; Table 1276-4 requires a minimum width of 20' at the right-of-way and 30' at the curb.

4. Eliminate the two parking spaces near the northwest corner of the building in order to provide Fire Department access; a minimum 20' wide access is required on the west side of the building.

5. The Fire Department requested that a fire line should be installed that runs the length of the property and to provide emergency vehicle access around the site. The applicant stated there will be a 30' wide access around the building when a portion of the trees are removed along the east side of the building, along with the demolition of the designated outbuildings. The Fire Department is requesting for turf re-enforcement to be installed on the west side of the addition to allow for emergency vehicle access.

6. The sidewalk extending from the existing house to the parking lot on the east side of the new facility ends in front of a parking space. This parking space should be eliminated and pedestrian access should be defined by means of striping, pursuant to Section 1278.09(d)(1).

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends moving the revised discussion plan to a detailed site plan, provided the above items are addressed.

Sanctus Development
(Discussion plan)

Location: North of Keller-Hanna Drive; south of St. Ambrose Church; and east of Keller water towers
Rezone from R-L District and C-G District to S-R District

Proposed Use & Background:
A discussion plan has been submitted to construct a senior living development on a 16.25-acre site consisting of a 21,585 sq. ft. 32-unit memory care facility that connects to a 69,588 sq. ft. 80-unit assisted living building, and 36 independent living cottages (9 buildings with 4 attached units each). The applicant is seeking to rezone the property to the S-R Senior Residence District from the existing C-G General Commercial District near the west property line, along with the majority of the property that is zoned R-L Low Density Residential District.

There is a notation on the site plan indicating compliance with the following requirements: minimum 2-acre lot area; 65' maximum building height; 30' front yard setback; 15' side yard setback (50' when adjacent to a residential district or use); and 50' rear yard setback when adjacent to a residential district or use, pursuant to Sections 1288.05(a), (c), (e), (f), and (g), respectively, of the Zoning Code.

Regarding building spacing, there is a notation on the site plan indicating the individual buildings, including their terraces, decks and patios, shall be separated by at least 30 feet except when windows of living areas, patios, decks, and terraces face each other, they shall be separated by at least 40 feet, unless vision-obscuring landscaping, walls, or fences are provided between the patios, decks, or terraces.

Common open space of 277,898 sq. ft. has been provided, which meets the minimum of 212,355 sq. (30%) required by Section 1288.07(b). Recreation space of 59,902 sq. ft., which has been divided into two large blocks of 45,671 sq. ft. on the north side of the site between the independent living units and assisted living facility, and 14,231 sq. ft. at the southeast corner of the site, meets the minimum 10,000 sq. ft. (100' x 100') required by Section 1288.07(c).

There are existing wetlands on the northeast, southwest, and south portions of the site. A retaining wall is shown along the northwest side of the site near the memory care facility, and the south side of the entrance drive from the assisted living facility leading to the independent living cottages.

Fifty-seven parking spaces are indicated for the assisted living and memory care units, in compliance with the minimum 56 spaces required by Table 1276-1(b)(6) - (1 space per 2 beds for the 80 assisted living units and 32 memory care units). Table 1276-1(a)(3) requires 1.5 parking spaces per dwelling for the 36 independent living units equaling 54 spaces, which can be accommodated in the two-car garage and driveway of each unit.

The parking spaces will measure 10’ wide x 20’ long, and have a minimum 24’ aisle width for two-way traffic, pursuant to Table 1276-3.

In accordance with Section 1288.08(a), ancillary facilities of a multi-purpose senior center; health and counseling offices; craft and meeting rooms; lounge area; and areas for passive and active recreation will be provided within the core of the building.

Pursuant to Section 1288.08(b)(1), vehicular circulation drives shall be located only at the perimeter of the site and parking areas may penetrate into the this area. The interior of the site shall be assigned completely for pedestrian use.

A conceptual color rendering has been submitted showing the front elevations of the independent living units, assisted living structure, and memory care facility that will use earth-tone colors, but construction materials have not been identified yet.

Staff Review Comments:

13. Section 1288.06(d)(1) states multi-family buildings with central hallways shall have a maximum of 60 units per building; the assisted living facility has 80 units and the attached memory care structure has 32 units, for a total of 112 units. A variance of 52 units will be required from the Board of Zoning Appeals.

14. Section 1288.05(b)((1) and (2) require a minimum of 650 sq. ft. for each one bedroom dwelling unit, and 120 sq. ft. for each additional bedroom. The applicant has stated the independent living cottages will comply with these amounts. However, the assisted living units are proposed at 450 sq. ft. and the memory care units are proposed at 325 sq. ft. Variances will also be necessary from the BZA.

15. Section 1288.03 states principally permitted uses in the S-R District are apartments and other attached multi-family or detached dwellings, but does not list memory care or assisted living facilities. Pursuant to Section 1280.01(b), the Planning Commission, with City Council approval, shall have the power to permit any use comparable in character to any of the specified uses listed under the principally permitted uses, permitted accessory uses, or conditionally permitted uses section of any district.

16. Provide the entrance drive width; Table 1276-4 requires a minimum 20’ width. An easement will be required from the City of Brunswick, as the entrance drive is located on property owned by the City.

17. Stormwater management shall be identified on the site plan.

18. Provide traffic circulation route to connect Alice Avenue and Ganyard Avenue on the east side of the site for emergency vehicle access. There is an existing gravel driveway which must be paved to connect the two streets, pursuant to Section 1276.10(c), and an easement will be required from St. Ambrose Church, as a portion of the connection is on their property.

19. The east drive will be gated to allow for emergency vehicle access only. Residents, employees, and visitors are not permitted to use this drive.

20. Provide visitor parking for the independent living units. Additionally, a minimum of one van-accessible handicap space shall be designated for the memory care facility and a minimum of two handicap spaces (one van-accessible) shall be shown for the assisted living building, in accordance with Table 1106.1 of the 2017 Ohio Building Code.

21. A minimum 4' wide sidewalk should be added along one side of the street in the independent living units which shall extend to the sidewalk east of the assisted living facility, pursuant to Section 1278.09(d)(1) and (2), which requires safe pedestrian connections between buildings and parking areas.

22. Private open space of 60 sq. ft. will be provided for the independent living units, as required by Section 1288.07(d). However, there is a notation on the plan that offering individual private open space for the assisted living and memory care units would be a safety concern. Therefore, a 4,045 sq. ft. secured patio will be installed on the west side of the assisted living building and a 2,146 sq. ft. secured patio will be constructed on the north side of the memory care facility, for a total of 6,191 sq. ft. A calculation of 112 units (80 assisted living units + 32 memory care units) x 60 sq. ft. = 6,720 sq. ft.

23. Provide location of the dumpster(s); pursuant to Section 1276.12(a), the dumpster enclosure shall be constructed of materials comparable to the building.

24. A hard surface access loop on the north side of the site between the assisted living facility and memory care building shall be provided for emergency vehicle access.

Staff Recommendations:
Staff withholds recommendation pending variances required by the Board of Zoning Appeals and until the above items are addressed.