

Brunswick City Planning Commission

September 20, 2018

7:00 p.m. – Caucus

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Joe Salzgeber, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Dev. Director

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 7:14 p.m.

The first item on the agenda was the review of the public hearing for The Orchard (formerly Quail Creek) Apartments revised conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan, Pearl Road and Magnolia Drive, extending south to Beverly Hills Drive. The Commission discussed the changes to the site plan. Ms. Plavecski noted they are missing a total of four parking spaces; two at the end of the drive between Buildings “M” and “N”, and two at the end of the drive between Buildings “O” and “P”, that were requested by the Planning Commission at their May 17, 2018 meeting. The Commission also noted the applicant needs to verify if the dog park and playground are still part of the site amenities.

The second item was the discussion of old business regarding approval of an independent consultant to review the Sanctus, LLC proposed SPD-5 rezoning and Design Guidelines, north of Keller-Hanna Drive, south of St. Ambrose Church, and east of Keller water towers. Ms. Plavecski noted the Administration held a phone conference on September 20, 2018 with Doug Harsany, the proposed independent consultant. Mr. Aungst commented Mr. Harsany has a great deal of experience in the planning profession. Mr. Hasan stated he would like the consultant to compare the proposed SPD-5 with similar facilities in the area.

Mr. Shirilla adjourned the meeting at 7:29 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

Brunswick City Planning Commission

September 20, 2018

7:30 p.m.

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Joe Salzgeber, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Dev. Director
Buck Withers, Withers Design Group, 120 Chambers Road,
Columbus, OH
Becky Andrews, Withers Design Group, same as above
Dave Cooper, Harsax Management, 9565 Midwest Avenue,
Suite A, Garfield Heights
Eric Kellum, 1053 Wood Park Lane, Brunswick

Item 1

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 7:33 p.m.

Ms. Plavecski called the roll: 5 Present 0 Absent.

Item 2

There were no announcements or correspondence.

Item 3

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 6, 2018.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 4 Ayes 0 Nays 1 Abstain (Mr. Arona).

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO MOVE ITEM 5(a) REGARDING OLD BUSINESS OF APPROVING AN INDEPENDENT CONSULTANT FOR THE SANTCUS LLC PROPOSED SPD-5 TO THE NEXT ITEM ON THE AGENDA.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 5(a)

Regarding the approval of the independent consultant to review the Sanctus, LLC proposed SDP-5 rezoning and Design Guidelines, north of Keller-Hanna Drive, south of St. Ambrose Church, and east of Keller water towers, Mr. Buck Withers and Ms. Becky Andrews, of Withers Design Group, were present.

Ms. Andrews noted their firm has not previously worked with Doug Harsany, but he has been recommended by another city planning office. Mr. Shirilla stated, based on Mr. Harsany's resume, he seems qualified.

Mr. Shirilla and Mr. Hasan stated they would like Mr. Harsany to address the following items:

1. Does the current site plan meet the purpose of a Special Planning District, pursuant to Section 1268.01 of the Zoning Code?
2. Will there be any impact, either positive or negative, to the surrounding community?
3. Applicant and consultant should be prepared to address concerns of the residents, i.e. stormwater run-off, traffic, noise, lighting. Project should be explained in terms the general public can understand.
4. Are there are proposed changes to the SPD-5 Design Guidelines, i.e. are they thorough enough or is more clarification needed.
5. Maximum height in the Design Guidelines for the West Neighborhood regarding the 2-story assisted living and memory care buildings, i.e. why is a 50' height required, as stated in Section 4(b)(iii).
6. Size of rooms for assisted living and memory care units should be addressed, per Section 4(b)(ii) of Design Guidelines, to see if they are comparable to other facilities in the area.
7. Estimation of additional traffic that will be generated from the proposed SPD-5.
8. Lighting – ensure there will be no light trespass on to residential neighborhoods.
9. Stormwater management will be a major concern.

Mr. Arona commented the proposed project must meet the purpose of an SPD, as stated in Section 1268.01 of the Zoning Code. Mr. Hasan stated it should be noted if this proposal will have any economic benefit to the city. Mr. Shirilla stated an operational summary statement should also be included, i.e. how many employees, background of the facility, etc.

MR. SAEGER MOTIONED TO APPROVE DOUGLAS HARSANY, JR. AS THE INDEPENDENT CONSULTANT FOR THE SANCTUS LLC PROPOSED SPD-5, AS PERMITTED BY SECTION 1278.03(h) OF THE ZONING CODE.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 4(a)

Concerning the public hearing for The Orchard (formerly Quail Creek) Apartments revised conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan, Pearl Road and Magnolia Drive, extending south to Beverly Hills Drive, Mr. Dave Cooper, of Harsax Management, was present.

Mr. Cooper explained there is a 6' grade change which looks great for the townhouse units when stepped, making them look like individual houses, which breaks up the roofline. Mr. Cooper commented they moved the pool and community building to the west, as it matched the width of the three buildings that were relocated. Mr. Shirilla asked how the headlights would be screened from the residents; Mr. Cooper responded there will be a mound, along with a split-rail fence along Pearl Road.

Mr. Cooper addressed the Staff Review Comments as follows:

1. The landscape plan shows a 4' high white vinyl split-rail fence within the front yard setback on Pearl Road, Magnolia Drive, and Beverly Hills Drive; Section 1464.05(a) states no fence shall be erected in a front yard between the street right of way and the front setback line except an ornamental fence not to exceed ten feet on either side of a driveway if installed in a straight line, or twenty feet if installed on an "L" shape or a lot corner, with a maximum 4' height. Variances were granted from the Board of Zoning Appeals at their September 11, 2018 meeting to allow the fences within the front yard setback.
2. Pursuant to Section 1282.06(e), provide a notation on the landscape plan indicating that a minimum of 10% of the total front yard area not used for parking or circulation shall be landscaped with trees, shrubs, planting beds, and/or perennial borders and beds in a design selected by the owner. Verify the landscape strip along the Pearl Road, Magnolia Drive, and Beverly Hills Drive rights-of-way has a minimum width of 10'. Mr. Cooper said they will comply with this requirement.
3. As required by Section 1282.08(b), Mr. Cooper stated they will include a notation on the landscape plan that a minimum of 7,400 sq. ft. of interior landscaping has been provided (370 parking spaces x 20 sq. ft.). The plan indicates that a minimum of 25 trees from Plant List "A" and a minimum of 200 shrubs from Plant List "D" or "E" will be planted, in compliance with the above section.
4. An entrance sign with pillars is indicated at the corner of Magnolia Drive and Pearl Road; and at Beverly Hills Drive and Pearl Road. Mr. Cooper noted the sign will

comply with Section 1270.04(b), which states no temporary or permanent sign over 3.75 feet in height shall be erected or maintained within 50' of an intersection, as measured from the point of intersection of the right-of-way lines. Section 1270.05 – Table B permits one ground sign per each street right-of-way; a 500' minimum distance is required between signs.

5. The Commission requested at their May 17th meeting that a minimum of four guest parking spaces at the rear of each drive located between Buildings “M” and “N”; and Buildings “O” and “P”, for a total of eight spaces should be added, located on the north side of Magnolia Drive; only a total of four spaces has been added. Mr. Cooper explained they don't want to have four spaces at the end of each drive because residents park their boats and trailers in these spaces and it becomes a maintenance issue. Mr. Jones commented there needs to be sufficient guest parking. Mr. Shirilla suggested having three spaces at the end of each drive as described above, for a total of six spaces. He said these spaces could be designated as “Visitor Parking Only”.
6. The approved May 17th plan indicated a playground and dog walk area, but they are not shown on the revised plan; verify if these amenities are still being provided. Mr. Cooper stated the playground is being eliminated and they will increase the size of the dog walk area to make up the additional space. The park and recreation fees attached to the conditional zoning certificate reflect this; the total figure will be the same.
7. Signage shall be installed to designate fire lanes between Buildings “M” and “N”; Buildings “O” and “P”; and the driveways on both sides of Buildings “A” and “B”. Mr. Cooper said they will comply with this requirement.
8. The proposed water main should extend from Beverly Hills Drive to Magnolia Drive, but should not be capped, subject to City of Cleveland Division of Water approval. Verify the fire hydrants are spaced every 300 feet apart. Mr. Cooper stated they will comply with the above.
9. Pursuant to Section 1286.07(b), City Council approval is required for multi-family developments.

Mr. Arona commented he doesn't like the backs of the townhomes facing Pearl Road. Mr. Cooper stated they are adding gables and architectural enhancements to the Pearl Road façade, along with mounding and a fence. Mr. Shirilla noted the applicant will be adding the above enhancements and the stormwater management area will have fountains in it. Mr. Arona said he still doesn't like the concept.

Mr. Shirilla declared the public hearing open, no one appeared, so he declared it closed.

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL TO CITY COUNCIL OF THE REVISED CONDITIONAL ZONING CERTIFICATE AND DETAILED SITE PLAN FOR THE ORCHARD (QUAIL CREEK) APARTMENTS, PEARL ROAD AND MAGNOLIA DRIVE, EXTENDING SOUTH TO BEVERLY HILLS DRIVE, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING:

1. THE LANDSCAPE PLAN SHOWS A 4' HIGH WHITE VINYL SPLIT-RAIL FENCE WITHIN THE FRONT YARD SETBACK ON PEARL ROAD, MAGNOLIA DRIVE, AND BEVERLY HILLS DRIVE; SECTION 1464.05(a) STATES NO FENCE SHALL BE ERECTED IN A FRONT YARD BETWEEN THE STREET RIGHT OF WAY AND THE FRONT SETBACK LINE EXCEPT AN ORNAMENTAL FENCE NOT TO EXCEED TEN FEET ON EITHER SIDE OF A DRIVEWAY IF INSTALLED IN A STRAIGHT LINE, OR TWENTY FEET IF INSTALLED ON AN "L" SHAPE OR A LOT CORNER, WITH A MAXIMUM 4' HEIGHT. VARIANCES WERE GRANTED BY THE BOARD OF ZONING APPEALS, AT THEIR MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 11, 2018, TO ALLOW THE FENCES WITHIN THE FRONT YARD SETBACK.
2. PURSUANT TO SECTION 1282.06(e), PROVIDE A NOTATION ON THE LANDSCAPE PLAN INDICATING THAT A MINIMUM OF 10% OF THE TOTAL FRONT YARD AREA NOT USED FOR PARKING OR CIRCULATION SHALL BE LANDSCAPED WITH TREES, SHRUBS, PLANTING BEDS, AND/OR PERENNIAL BORDERS AND BEDS IN A DESIGN SELECTED BY THE OWNER. VERIFY THE LANDSCAPE STRIP ALONG THE PEARL ROAD, MAGNOLIA DRIVE, AND BEVERLY HILLS DRIVE RIGHTS-OF-WAY HAS A MINIMUM WIDTH OF 10'.
3. AS REQUIRED BY SECTION 1282.08(b), INCLUDE A NOTATION ON THE LANDSCAPE PLAN THAT A MINIMUM OF 7,400 SQ. FT. OF INTERIOR LANDSCAPING HAS BEEN PROVIDED (370 PARKING SPACES X 20 SQ. FT.). THE PLAN INDICATES THAT A MINIMUM OF 25 TREES FROM PLANT LIST "A" AND A MINIMUM OF 200 SHRUBS FROM PLANT LIST "D" OR "E" WILL BE PLANTED, IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE ABOVE SECTION.
4. AN ENTRANCE SIGN WITH PILLARS IS INDICATED AT THE CORNER OF MAGNOLIA DRIVE AND PEARL ROAD; AND AT BEVERLY HILLS DRIVE AND PEARL ROAD. VERIFY COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 1270.04(b), WHICH STATES NO TEMPORARY OR PERMANENT SIGN OVER 3.75 FEET IN HEIGHT SHALL BE ERECTED OR MAINTAINED WITHIN 50' OF AN INTERSECTION, AS MEASURED FROM THE POINT OF INTERSECTION OF THE RIGHT-OF-WAY LINES. SECTION 1270.05 – TABLE B PERMITS ONE GROUND SIGN PER EACH STREET RIGHT-OF-WAY; A 500' MINIMUM DISTANCE IS REQUIRED BETWEEN SIGNS.
5. ON THE NORTH SIDE OF MAGNOLIA DRIVE, THE APPLICANT HAS AGREED TO ADD A MINIMUM OF THREE GUEST PARKING SPACES AT THE REAR OF EACH DRIVE LOCATED BETWEEN BUILDINGS "M" AND "N"; AND BUILDINGS "O" AND "P", FOR A TOTAL OF SIX SPACES, INSTEAD OF THE TOTAL EIGHT SPACES APPROVED AT THE MAY 17, 2018 MEETING.
6. THE APPLICANT HAS INDICATED THE PLAYGROUND, WHICH WAS APPROVED AT THE MAY 17TH MEETING, WILL BE ELIMINATED AND THE SIZE OF THE DOG WALK AREA INCREASED, WHICH SHALL BE SHOWN ON THE FINAL SITE PLAN.

THE PARK AND RECREATION FEES ATTACHED TO THE CONDITIONAL ZONING CERTIFICATE REFLECT THIS REVISION.

7. SIGNAGE SHALL BE INSTALLED TO DESIGNATE FIRE LANES BETWEEN BUILDINGS "M" AND "N"; BUILDINGS "O" AND "P"; AND THE DRIVEWAYS ON BOTH SIDES OF BUILDINGS "A" AND "B".
8. THE PROPOSED WATER MAIN SHOULD EXTEND FROM BEVERLY HILLS DRIVE TO MAGNOLIA DRIVE, BUT SHOULD NOT BE CAPPED, SUBJECT TO CITY OF CLEVELAND DIVISION OF WATER APPROVAL. FIRE HYDRANTS SHOULD BE SPACED EVERY 300 FEET APART.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 4 Ayes 1 Nay (Mr. Arona).

Item 6

There was no new business.

Item 7

No one appeared at the public comment period.

Item 8

Mr. Salzgeber stated there was no Council Representative's Report.

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:33 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

September 20, 2018

The Orchard (formerly Quail Creek) Apartments

(Revised site plan)

Location: Pearl Road & Magnolia Drive, extending south to Beverly Hills Drive
C-G District

Proposed Use & Background:

The Planning Commission, at their meeting on May 17, 2018, and City Council, at their meeting on June 11, 2018, pursuant to Section 1286.07(b) of the Zoning Code, approved the conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan for Quail Creek Apartments (now renamed "The Orchard").

The number of units has not changed from the originally approved 105 units, which will consist of nine townhouse buildings (49 total units for Buildings "C", "D", "G", "H", "I", "M", "N", "O", and "P"); and seven 2-story walk-up buildings (56 total units for Buildings "A", "B", "E", "F", "J", "K", and "L"). However, the building lay-out has been changed from the Planning Commission's May 17, 2018 approval to indicate that four townhouse structures (Buildings "C", "D", "G" and "H") on the east side of Pearl Road, north of Beverly Hills Drive, will be grouped together near the southern portion of the site, due to aesthetic reasons. Furthermore, four of the 2-story walk-up buildings (Buildings "E", "F", "K" and "L") will be grouped together south of Magnolia Drive near the northern portion of the site.

The community building and swimming pool have been relocated from the east side of the site near the Hickory Hills Apartments to the west side near Pearl Road. Pursuant to Section 1278.09(d), a 4' wide sidewalk is shown from the parking lot on the east side of the stormwater management area which connects to a 6' wide sidewalk adjacent to the parking lot on the south side of the community building and pool. Parking for these amenities has been reconfigured so that a total of 45 spaces is now shown east of the retention basin and south of the pool and community building, instead of the previous 36 spaces, in compliance with the minimum 31 spaces required by Table 1276-1(c)(5) and (7). The above parking lots will service the community building and swimming pool.

Two fountains will be located in the stormwater management area and a gazebo is shown on the east side of the basin. The mailbox area is located on a section of pavement east of the pool.

A variance was obtained from the Board of Zoning Appeals on January 16, 2018 to allow eleven (11) buildings to have eight attached units; Section 1286.02(e)(1) permits a maximum of 6 attached units in a single building.

A photometrics plan has been submitted in compliance with the minimum 0.6 footcandle level for parking and pedestrian areas, and maximum 2.4 footcandle average illumination level, pursuant to Section 1276.14(a) and (c), respectively.

Staff Review Comments:

1. The landscape plan shows a 4' high white vinyl split-rail fence within the front yard setback on Pearl Road, Magnolia Drive, and Beverly Hills Drive; Section 1464.05(a) states no fence shall be erected in a front yard between the street right of way and the front setback line except an ornamental fence not to exceed ten feet on either side of a driveway if installed in a straight line, or twenty feet if installed on an "L" shape or a lot corner, with a maximum 4' height. The applicant is seeking a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals at their September 11, 2018 meeting. The Administration is in support of granting a variance, as the proposed fences delineate between public and private space and the detention areas.
2. Pursuant to Section 1282.06(e), provide a notation on the landscape plan indicating that a minimum of 10% of the total front yard area not used for parking or circulation shall be landscaped with trees, shrubs, planting beds, and/or perennial borders and beds in a design selected by the owner. Verify the landscape strip along the Pearl Road, Magnolia Drive, and Beverly Hills Drive rights-of-way has a minimum width of 10'.
3. As required by Section 1282.08(b), include a notation on the landscape plan that a minimum of 7,400 sq. ft. of interior landscaping has been provided (370 parking spaces x 20 sq. ft.). The plan indicates that a minimum of 25 trees from Plant List "A" and a minimum of 200 shrubs from Plant List "D" or "E" will be planted, in compliance with the above section.
4. An entrance sign with pillars is indicated at the corner of Magnolia Drive and Pearl Road; and at Beverly Hills Drive and Pearl Road. Verify compliance with Section 1270.04(b), which states no temporary or permanent sign over 3.75 feet in height shall be erected or maintained within 50' of an intersection, as measured from the point of intersection of the right-of-way lines. Section 1270.05 – Table B permits one ground sign per each street right-of-way; a 500' minimum distance is required between signs.
5. The Commission requested at their May 17th meeting that a minimum of four guest parking spaces at the rear of each drive located between Buildings "N" and "O"; and Buildings "P" and "Q", for a total of eight spaces should be added, located on the north side of Magnolia Drive; only a total of four spaces has been added.
6. The approved May 17th plan indicated a playground and dog walk area, but they are not shown on the revised plan; verify if these amenities are still being provided.
7. Signage shall be installed to designate fire lanes between Buildings "N" and "O"; Buildings "P" and "Q"; and the driveways on both sides of Buildings "A" and "B".

8. The proposed water main should extend from Beverly Hills Drive to Magnolia Drive, but should not be capped, subject to City of Cleveland Division of Water approval. Verify the fire hydrants are spaced every 300 feet apart.
9. Pursuant to Section 1286.07(b), City Council approval is required for multi-family developments.

Staff Recommendations

Staff recommends approval of the revised conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan, subject to City Council approval, and provided the above items are addressed.