

Brunswick City Planning Commission

December 6, 2018

7:00 p.m. – Caucus

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Joe Salzgeber, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Dev. Director

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 7:10 p.m.

The first item was the review of the discussion plan for Brunswick Middle School, Phase 2, 1483 Pearl Road. The Commission discussed the building façade.

The second item was the review of the discussion plan for Chick-fil-A restaurant, 3446 Center Road (former Getgo site). Mr. Shirilla stated he was concerned about the location of pedestrian walkways to Brunswick Lake Parkway and Center Road, as the drive-thru is in the way. Mr. Hasan questioned if there will be a sufficient number of parking spaces on the site. Mr. Shirilla noted the drive-thru layout for Chick-fil-A is not consistent with other restaurants in the area. Mr. Aungst said he is concerned about headlights from cars in the drive-thru being a distraction to drivers on Center Road.

The third item was the review of the revised discussion plan and design guidelines for the Sanctus, LLC proposed SPD-5, north of Keller-Hanna Drive, south of St. Ambrose Church, and east of the Keller water towers. Ms. Plavecski noted the changes suggested by the Planning Commission and Doug Harsany (independent consultant) have been outlined in the Staff Report.

Mr. Shirilla adjourned the meeting at 7:37 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

Brunswick City Planning Commission

December 6, 2018

7:30 p.m.

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Joe Salzgeber, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Dev. Director
Robert Saggese, Brixmor, 22054 Farmington, Farmington, MI
DeWayne Hein, Brixmor, same
Greg Schunck, Mannik & Smith Group, 20600 Chagrin Boulevard,
Suite 500, Shaker Heights
John Urbanick, Greenland Engineering, 4133 Erie Street,
Willoughby
Sam Grida, Brunswick City Schools, 3643 Center Rd., Brunswick
Ed Shearson, Then Design Architects, 4139 Erie Street,
Willoughby
Allan Wiley, 565 White Pond Drive, Akron
Ryan Weller, Hammond Construction, 1278 Park Avenue, Canton
Becky Andrews, Withers Design Group, 1250 Chambers Road,
Suite 110, Columbus

Item 1

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 7:43 p.m.

Ms. Plavecski called the roll: 5 Present 0 Absent.

Item 2

There were no announcements or correspondence.

Item 3

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 15, 2018.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 4 Ayes 0 Nays 1 Abstain (Mr. Arona).

Item 4(a)

Regarding the discussion plan for Brunswick Middle School, Phase 2, 1483 Pearl Road, Mr. Ed Shearson, of Then Design; Mr. Sam Grida, of Brunswick City Schools; Mr. John Urbanick, of Greenland Engineering; and Mr. Ryan Weller, of Hammond Construction, were present.

Mr. Shearson described the project and addressed the Staff Review Comments as follows:

1. The size of the temporary gravel construction laydown/staging/parking area (activity area) near the north and east property lines has been increased so that it now encroaches into the 100' setback from all residential property lines required for structures and activity areas, pursuant to Section 1274.08(a). Additionally, the construction trailer has been relocated so that it also encroaches into the 100' setback on the north side of the property. The applicant will be seeking variances from the Board of Zoning Appeals at their meeting on December 18, 2018.
2. Verify on the detailed site plan that a minimum of 8,820 sq. ft. (441 parking spaces x 20 sq. ft.) of interior landscaping will be provided, pursuant to Section 1282.08(b). This landscaping shall consist of 30 trees from Plant List "A" and 236 shrubs from Plant Lists "D" or "E". Mr. Urbanick stated they will not be able to provide interior landscaping in the bus parking area, as there is insufficient room, but they will add screening around the perimeter of the area. He explained they are currently double-counting some of the parking by the bus area, but they will indicate an accurate count on the detailed site plan.
3. Pursuant to Section 1282.08(a), a 5' wide parking perimeter strip shall be installed along the edge of the southern parking lots containing plant material from Plant Lists "D" or "E" that will achieve a decorative planting with a minimum height of 4'. Mr. Shearson said they will add it.
4. A minimum 10' wide perimeter screening strip shall be provided along the Pearl Road and Manhattan Avenue rights-of-way, as required by Section 1282.06(g). Mr. Shearson stated they will comply with this requirement.
5. A color rendering and building façade materials was submitted to the Administration on December 5, 2018, in accordance with Section 1278.08 pertaining to building design and character. Mr. Shearson explained the façade is primarily brick, except on the east and south sides of the building that will use decorative concrete masonry units (CMU). Mr. Hasan noted on the north elevation – Area C, where the two arrows are shown on the plan, that it has been mislabeled showing the same color, instead of two different colors; Mr. Shearson stated they will correct that. Mr. Arona asked about the design and colors for the middle school; Mr. Shearson replied the building is styled with a more nostalgic look. Mr. Shirilla inquired about the cornices at the top of the

building; Mr. Shearson responded they will protrude 1'6". Mr. Shirilla questioned if the recesses and projections will have enough depth to be viewed from the street; Mr. Shearson answered yes. Mr. Hasan asked if the middle school students were consulted regarding the building facade; Mr. Shearson replied yes; they had a visioning session of approximately 100 people including staff and students. Mr. Shearson showed a 3-dimensional rendering to the Commission.

6. As required by Section 1278.09(d), pedestrian walkways have been provided leading from the school to Pearl Road and Manhattan Avenue. Pursuant to Section 1278.09(d)(3), verify there is a minimum 5' sidewalk width to accommodate two pedestrian lanes for heavy pedestrian traffic. A continuous sidewalk shall be provided on Pearl Road and Manhattan Avenue after construction traffic is finished. Mr. Shearson said they will provide this.
7. Mr. Shearson noted the vision for Princeton Drive pedestrian traffic will be addressed in Phase 3.
8. He also commented the reworking of the drainage on Princeton Drive will be handled in Phase 3.
9. Confirm that parking for the stadium will only be near the west school entrance. Mr. Shearson stated they will add some handicap accessible parking spaces by the north side of the site near the construction drive. Mr. Arona inquired if there will be public access from Princeton Drive to the stadium; Mr. Shearson replied it will be addressed in Phase 3.
10. A traffic study has been submitted to the City Engineer.
11. Mr. Shearson commented emergency vehicle access off Princeton Drive will be addressed in Phase 3.
12. He noted the location of the fence around the athletic complex will be shown in Phase 3.

MR. SAEGER MOTIONED TO MOVE THE DISCUSSION PLAN TO A DETAILED SITE PLAN AND PUBLIC HEARING FOR BRUNSWICK MIDDLE SCHOOL, 1483 PEARL ROAD, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING: THE APPLICANT WILL BE SEEKING VARIANCES FROM THE BOARD OF ZONING APPEALS AT THEIR MEETING ON DECEMBER 18, 2018 FOR ENCROACHMENT INTO THE 100-FT. ACTIVITY AREA FOR THE STAGING AREA AND CONSTRUCTION TRAILER. THE APPLICANT HAS AGREED TO COMPLY WITH STAFF REVIEW COMMENTS 2, 3, 4, 5, AND 6. STAFF REVIEW COMMENTS 7, 8, 11, AND 12 WILL BE ADDRESSED IN PHASE 3. THE APPLICANT WILL CONFIRM AND COMPLY WITH STAFF REVIEW COMMENT 9 STATING THAT PARKING FOR THE STADIUM WILL ONLY BE NEAR THE WEST SCHOOL ENTRANCE AND THE APPLICANT HAS AGREED TO ADD HANDICAP ACCESSIBLE PARKING SPACES BY THE NORTH

SIDE OF THE SITE NEAR THE CONSTRUCTION DRIVE. THE APPLICANT HAS COMPLIED WITH STAFF REVIEW COMMENT 10. The NUMBER OF PARKING SPACES FOR BUS STORAGE SHALL BE ELIMINATED FROM THE NUMBER OF PARKING SPACES USED TO CALCULATE INTERIOR LANDSCAPING.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Mr. Hasan commented in return for a possible modification on the amount of interior landscaping, as permitted by Section 1282.10(a), screening will be provided between the bus storage area and the adjacent properties.

Item 4(b)

Concerning the discussion plan for Chick-fil-A restaurant, Mr. Greg Schunck, of Mannick & Smith Group; and Mr. Robert Saggese, and Mr. DeWayne Hein, of Brixmor, were present.

Mr. Schunck addressed the Staff Review Comments as follows:

1. Table 1276-1(d)(4) requires a minimum of 56 parking spaces (1 space per 2 seats, 112 total seats); however, 29 spaces are provided, resulting in 27 spaces that are still needed. As the subject property is part of a unified site, a parking plan for the entire site has been submitted to verify there will be adequate parking. Mr. Schunck explained they are proposing to remove 103 parking spaces and replace them with 29 spaces. He stated there are currently 1,272 parking spaces on the entire site and when calculating the required number of spaces for the existing tenants based on the city's Zoning Code, 1,067 spaces are necessary, giving them 205 spaces above the requirement. He noted if they deduct the additional 27 spaces needed for Chick-fil-A, it still leaves 104 spaces over code requirement. Mr. Schunck noted this figure does not include parking for Comfort Suites Hotel.
2. Suggest eliminating the dumpster, as it will be highly visible from Center Road at its current location, and utilizing the existing former Getgo dumpster. Mr. Schunck passed out a revised site plan showing that the dumpster has been turned. He said using the former Getgo dumpster isn't possible as it is outside of the lease area for Chick-fil-A. Mr. Wylie said trash is emptied several times a day, but it is done during nonpeak times, in order not to interfere with drive-thru traffic. Mr. Shirilla commented the dumpster is visible from the Center Road thoroughfare and other tenants at Brunswick Town Center were not permitted to do that. He also noted the focal point of Chick-fil-A is not the building, but the drive-thru, and suggested relocating the drive-thru on the opposite (south) side of the building and moving the structure further north, closer to Center Road. Mr. Shirilla commented he likes the façade of the building. Mr. Arona noted the service side of the building is facing Brunswick Lake Parkway, which is an unfavorable view.

As there are extra parking spaces on the site, Ms. Plavecski suggested turning the building so the drive-thru is located on the east side of the building and the dumpster

would be located on the south side where it isn't visible from Center Road. Mr. Wylie said cars would back up on Brunswick Lake Parkway if they don't have enough stacking room for the drive-thru. Mr. Shirilla asked what percentage of Chick-fil-A's business is from the drive-thru; Mr. Wylie replied 65%. Mr. Incorvaia asked if there is protected parking on the site for Giant Eagle; Mr. Hein answered this is a unified site whereby they can park anywhere they want. He explained there is a legal lease agreement with Giant Eagle so they can't build in certain areas.

Mr. Jones commented the layout presented tonight cleans up a mess on Brunswick Lake Parkway and gets the traffic off that street. Mr. Aungst noted the community's focus is on health, safety and welfare. He said there is a tremendous problem with parking and the dumpster needs to be emptied during the day. He also inquired where the snow is going to be put.

3. In accordance with Section 1278.09(d), Chick-fil-A must provide a pedestrian walkway to Center Road and Brunswick Lake Parkway, as well as for internal foot traffic to the plaza. Additionally, bike racks shall be installed.
4. The 42" storm sewer must be relocated, to which Mr. Schunck agreed.
5. Mr. Shirilla informed Mr. Schunck that Section 1270.05 – Table B permits only one wall sign per each street frontage; therefore, one wall sign on the north elevation facing Center Road and one wall sign on the west elevation facing Brunswick Lake Parkway are allowed.
6. Mr. Schunck stated they are in the process of performing a traffic study.

Mr. Shirilla reiterated the Commission's concerns as follows:

1. The location of the drive-thru and stacking room.
2. The dumpster location being highly visible from Center Road.
3. The building elevation facing Center Road is a drive-thru.
4. Pedestrian mobility and amenities.

Mr. Hasan suggested moving Chick-fil-A to another location in the Main Street District, such as being closer to Town Center Boulevard.

Mr. Schunck requested the discussion plan to be tabled.

MR. ARONA MOTIONED, AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST, TO TABLE THE DISCUSSION PLAN FOR CHICK-FIL-A RESTAURANT, 3446 CENTER ROAD.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.
Item 4(c)

Regarding the revised discussion plan and design guidelines for the Sanctus, LLC proposed SPD-5, north of Keller-Hanna Drive, south of St. Ambrose Church, and east of the Keller

water towers, Mr. Buck Withers and Ms. Becky Andrews, of Withers Design Group, were present.

Ms. Andrews stated they have incorporated the Planning Commission's and Mr. Harsany's comments into the revised Design Guidelines. Mr. Withers commented they will hold a neighborhood meeting for the project on either December 8, 9, or 10, 2018 at St. Ambrose Church, or at another location if the church hall is unavailable.

Mr. Arona questioned if the project is being constructed to universal design standards; Mr. Withers responded yes. Mr. Arona suggested adding this requirement to Section 2(b) of the Guidelines; Ms. Andrews commented they will already be adding universal standards to the units to provide easy accessibility for elderly residents.

Mr. Salzgeber stated City Council is concerned with stormwater run-off and that the driveway at the east end of Alice Avenue and Ganyard Avenue will not be used on a regular basis. Mr. Shirilla commented that drive is for emergency vehicle access only and will have a break-away gate.

Mr. Hasan questioned if there is a certain number of rooms that are federally required to be ADA accessible; Mr. Withers responded yes. Ms. Andrews suggested adding the universal design verbiage to Section 2(b) of the Guidelines; Mr. Incorvaia noted "universal design" would have to be defined, as it is too broad a term. Ms. Andrews stated there was no official definition of universal design; therefore, Mr. Arona agreed to eliminate the term and leave Section 2(b) as written.

Concerning lighting standards, Ms. Andrews said they will change "lumens" to "footcandles", as the Zoning Code lighting requirements are measured in those terms. Mr. Hasan noted there is a difference between lumens and footcandles; lumens measures the lighting level radiating from the light source, and footcandles measure the amount of ground lighting. Therefore, Mr. Hasan stated he would like the Guidelines to remain as written. Mr. Withers commented he would like to discuss this issue with a lighting expert, to which the Commission agreed.

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO MOVE THE DEVELOPMENT GUIDELINES, CONCEPTUAL PLAN, AND PROPOSED SPD-5 REZONING TO A PUBLIC HEARING.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 5

There was no old business.

Item 6

Concerning new business, Mr. Rocha noted on the 2019 Planning Commission Meeting Schedule, that the June meeting dates show 2018, instead of 2019. Ms. Plavecski said she will correct it and will provide a revised schedule to the Commission.

Item 7

No one appeared at the public comment period.

Item 8

Mr. Salzgeber stated there was no Council Representative's Report at this time.

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:27 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

December 6, 2018

Brunswick Middle School – Phase 2

(Discussion plan)

Location: 1483 Pearl Road
R-L District and C-G District

Proposed Use & Background:

The Phase 2 application has been submitted to construct a 238,500 sq. ft. new middle school for grades 6 through 8 on the existing Visintainer/Edwards Middle School site. The building will be a three-story facility with two-story event spaces. Projected occupancy for the structure is 1,659 students, per the Ohio Facilities Construction Commission master plan, with 164 employees. The project will now be constructed in three phases; Phase 3 will include a new football/soccer stadium that will consist of 1,800 bleacher seats (1,200 home seats and 600 visitor seats) that will be located near the east side of the site. Educational institutions are a conditionally permitted use in the R-L District pursuant to Section 1252.04(a), subject to Section 1274.08(a), (b), (e), and (h) of the Zoning Code.

At their meeting on August 9, 2018, the Planning Commission approved the Phase 1 detailed site plan and conditional zoning certificate for site improvements and the demolition of the four residential houses on Princeton Drive and the one home on Oxford Drive, along with the commercial tattoo parlor at 1435 Pearl Road. Pursuant to Section 1276.15(b) of the Zoning Code, the Planning Commission granted a modification to allow the temporary gravel parking and staging area, instead of a paved surface as required by Section 1276.10(c), on the east side of the building where the future stadium will be located. Also, as permitted by Section 1276.15(b), the Commission granted a modification to allow a gravel temporary construction drive, instead of a paved drive required by Section 1276.10(c), leading from Manhattan Avenue on the north side of the site to the gravel construction staging area on the east side of the building.

A total of 441 parking spaces are shown on the site; Table 1276-1 does not require a minimum number, but states the parking needs for schools shall be sufficient to meet all parking needs of the proposed use. No parking, loading or servicing shall be located on street rights-of-way or landscaped areas. Parking for the buses will occur on the southern portion of the site. The main entrance to the middle school will be between the sixth and seventh grade sections of the building facing northwest.

Pursuant to Section 1282.06(d), a 15' side and/or rear screening yard will be provided with either a staggered double row of evergreens and trees from Plant Lists "B" and "C", 15' on-center plus a single row of 6' tall hedge from Plant List "E"; or a 6' tall wall or fence and trees from Plant List "A", 25' to 35' on-center. On the south side of the site abutting the rear yards of residential homes on Oxford Drive, a screening fence, in conjunction with landscaping, is

shown. Furthermore, a fence and landscaping will be installed on the west side of the residential home on Oxford Drive and along the southern parking lot.

A photometrics plan has been submitted indicating the parking and pedestrian areas comply with the minimum 0.6 footcandle and maximum 2.4 footcandles permitted by Section 1276.14(a) and (c). Additionally, lighting levels adjacent to the residential property lines comply with the maximum one footcandle permitted by Section 1276.14(d), and the average illumination levels comply with Section 1276.14(c).

Staff Review Comments:

13. The size of the temporary gravel construction laydown/staging/parking area (activity area) near the north and east property lines has been increased so that it now encroaches into the 100' setback from all residential property lines required for structures and activity areas, pursuant to Section 1274.08(a). Additionally, the construction trailer has been relocated so that it also encroaches into the 100' setback on the north side of the property. The applicant will be seeking variances from the Board of Zoning Appeals at their meeting on December 18, 2018.
14. Verify on the detailed site plan that a minimum of 8,820 sq. ft. (441 parking spaces x 20 sq. ft.) of interior landscaping will be provided, pursuant to Section 1282.08(b). This landscaping shall consist of 30 trees from Plant List "A" and 236 shrubs from Plant Lists "D" or "E".
15. Pursuant to Section 1282.08(a), a 5' wide parking perimeter strip shall be installed along the edge of the southern parking lots containing plant material from Plant Lists "D" or "E" that will achieve a decorative planting with a minimum height of 4'.
16. A minimum 10' wide perimeter screening strip shall be provided along the Pearl Road and Manhattan Avenue rights-of-way, as required by Section 1282.06(g).
17. A color rendering and building façade materials shall be submitted in accordance with Section 1278.08 pertaining to building design and character.
18. As required by Section 1278.09(d), pedestrian walkways have been provided leading from the school to Pearl Road and Manhattan Avenue. Pursuant to Section 1278.09(d)(3), verify there is a minimum 5' sidewalk width to accommodate two pedestrian lanes for heavy pedestrian traffic. A continuous sidewalk shall be provided on Pearl Road and Manhattan Avenue after construction traffic is finished.
19. What is the vision for Princeton Drive pedestrian traffic; will this be addressed in Phase 3?
20. Does the drainage on Princeton Drive need to be reworked; if so, how will this addressed?
21. Confirm that parking for the stadium will only be near the west school entrance.

22. A traffic study will need to be submitted and reviewed with the detailed site plan.
23. Will emergency vehicle access be provided off Princeton Drive?
24. Provide the location of the fence around the athletic complex.
25. A public hearing and conditional zoning certificate will be required for each phase of the development.

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends moving the discussion plan to a detailed site plan, provided the above items are addressed, and pending the granting of variances for the activity areas by the BZA.

Chick-fil-A

(Discussion plan)

Location: 3446 Center Road (former Getgo Station)
Brunswick Town Center SPD-2 Main Street District

Proposed Use & Background:

An application has been submitted to construct a 4,993 sq. ft. restaurant on the site of the now demolished Getgo gas station, in compliance with the maximum 8,000 sq. ft. lot coverage permitted by Section D of the "Type VI Outparcel Buildings". There is a 10' front yard setback on Center Road and Brunswick Lake Parkway, in accordance with Section IV.F for Type VI Anchor Tenant Buildings.

Pursuant to Section A(7) of the Main Street District General Requirements, restaurants are a permitted use, and Section B(12) allows drive-thru windows on Type VI Outparcel Buildings. As required by Section 1276.10(j), a minimum stacking room of 130 feet has been met for the drive-thru window, which is located on the south side of the building. Entry to the facility is on the east side of the restaurant; no outdoor seating is proposed.

Parking stall dimensions are shown as 9' wide x 24' long for 60° angle parking, in compliance with the minimum 9' wide x 21' long spaces required by Table 1276-3. The aisle width for one-way traffic is shown as 20', which meets the minimum 18' needed by the above Table. The northern driveway on Brunswick Lake Parkway will be removed. Two van-accessible handicap parking spaces are indicated, as required by Table 1106.1 and Section 1106.5 of the 2017 Ohio Building Code.

The building will be constructed with brick veneer in earth-tone colors of "Whitehall" for the upper portion of the building, along with "Khaki Matt" for the remainder of the structure, and will include dark bronze canopies over the entrance doors and windows, in compliance with Section C(1)(a), (b), and (f) of the Type VI Outparcel Buildings.

Staff Review Comments:

7. Table 1276-1(d)(4) requires a minimum of 56 parking spaces (1 space per 2 seats, 112 total seats); however, 29 spaces are provided, resulting in 27 spaces that are still needed. As the subject property is part of a unified site, a parking plan for the entire site shall be submitted to verify there will be adequate parking.
8. Suggest eliminating the dumpster, as it will be highly visible from Center Road at its current location, and utilizing the existing former Getgo dumpster.
9. In accordance with Section 1278.09(d), Chick-fil-A must provide a pedestrian walkway to Center Road and Brunswick Lake Parkway, as well as for internal foot traffic to the plaza. Additionally, bike racks shall be installed.
10. The 42" storm sewer must be relocated.
11. Section 1270.05 – Table B permits only one wall sign per each street frontage; therefore, one wall sign on the north elevation facing Center Road and one wall sign on the west elevation facing Brunswick Lake Parkway are allowed.
12. A traffic study shall be reviewed in conjunction with the detailed site plan.

Staff Recommendations:

Staff withholds recommendation until the above items are addressed.

Sanctus, LLC

(Revised discussion plan and Design Guidelines)

Location: North of Keller-Hanna Drive, south of St. Ambrose Church, and east of the Keller water towers
Rezone from existing C-G and R-L Districts to proposed SPD-5

Proposed Use & Background:

A revised discussion plan and proposed SPD-5 Design Guidelines have been submitted in response to the report performed by Doug Harsany (independent consultant). The Planning Commission tabled the discussion plan and Design Guidelines at their meeting on September 6, 2018, in order to request the services of an independent consultant, as permitted by Section 1278.03(h) of the Zoning Code.

Changes to the Design Guidelines, as suggested by the Planning Commission and Mr. Harsany are as follows:

1. Section 2(b)(iv) has been revised from stating there shall not be more than two exterior steps to any building used by the occupants to state "All pedestrian walkways designed for the use by residents shall be accessible. In addition, at least one accessible route within the site shall be provided from any public transportation stops,

accessible parking, all resident facilities, accessible passenger loading zones, and public streets or sidewalks to an accessible entrance to each housing unit.”

2. Section 3(d)(ii)(1) has been added which states “The buffer area to the South shall be maximized by thoughtful placement of built components, such as buildings and roads to the north of this buffer. The natural vegetation, and especially large trees, within this buffered area shall be protected to the extent possible. The construction process, addressing of drainage issues, and stream enhancement efforts shall be done with sensitivity and care to avoid damage to trees and root systems, within this buffered area. Where it is impossible to save trees during the construction process, drainage work, and stream enhancement efforts, appropriate trees shall be replanted.”
3. Section 3(d)(iv)(1) has been added which reads “The natural vegetation, and especially large trees, within the buffered area to the east shall be protected, to the extent possible. Construction shall be done with sensitivity and care to avoid damage to trees and root systems within this buffered area. Additional trees of appropriate species, both evergreen and deciduous, will also be added in this east end buffer to enhance the buffer’s effectiveness.”
4. Section 3(d)(v) has been amended and now includes six subsections as follows:
“Trees of an appropriate species and mature size shall be planted along the main roadways on both sides, and in other locations, as appropriate to add shade, reduce wind, and enhance aesthetics of the site. Thought shall be given in the selection and placement of new trees to the following:
 - (1) The tree species’ hardiness, appropriateness for the climate, and susceptibility to disease and pests.
 - (2) The tree species’ messiness, speed of growth, and maintenance requirements.
 - (3) The appropriateness of the mature trees’ size, shape, and overall aesthetic appeal to the scale and texture of the built and natural environment in which it will be placed.
 - (4) The root structure’s potential damage to walks, roadways, foundations, pipes, and other structural elements.
 - (5) The potential rubbing of a mature tree’s branches on buildings.
 - (6) A growing tree’s potential for interference with snow removal and clear sight lines of vehicular traffic.”
5. Section 3(e) is now entitled “Lighting Standards” and has been revised to include six subsections as follows: “**Lighting Standards**: Lighting shall be provided near all circulation areas, buildings, and recreation areas where appropriate. The lighting design shall follow the guidelines below to promote safety, conserve resources, reduce effects on neighbors, and avoid light pollution.
 - i) Exterior lighting shall be designed and located at a pedestrian scale consistent with pedestrian movements and the neighborhood.
 - ii) The site shall be lit in a way that promotes use of the area after dark and addresses safety concerns.
 - iii) Lighting shall be spaced together closely to create an even lighting of the

- sidewalk, features a white light, and be concealed or shielded to avoid glare.
- iv) Lighting poles and fixtures shall be compatible with the function and design of the feature and the aesthetics of the property.
 - v) The position of a lamp along a pedestrian walkway shall not exceed fifteen feet in height above the surface of the walkway.
 - vi) Total installed initial luminaire lumens of all outdoor lighting shall not exceed the total site lumen limit, which is 2.5 lumens per square foot of hardscape. The following shall be provided to the zoning commission prior to final plat approval.
 - (a) A calculation of the total square footage of hardscape in the project, the total allowable lumens, and the total lumens and foot-candles of outdoor lighting to be installed.
 - (b) A table showing all exterior luminaires to be installed, their output in lumens, and the height at which they will be installed.
 - (c) In addition, all exterior lighting shall comply with the requirements, as outlined in 1276.14 of the City of Brunswick Planning and Zoning Code.”

6. **Common Open Space** – now re-lettered to Section (f), and **Parking and Road Standards** - now re-lettered to Section (g).

7. Section 4(b)(v)(1) entitled “**Accessibility Standards**” has been added as follows: All facilities shall meet the accessibility standards, as outlined in the Ohio Administrative Code 4101:1-11-01.”

8. **Building Design Standards** has been renumbered to Section (vi). Subsection (vi)(5) has been added to read “Earth tones will prevail in the color scheme throughout the West Neighborhood. Subsection (5) has been renumbered to subsection (6) and the following subsections have been added:

- (7) “All roofs will maintain at least a 4/12 pitch, with the predominant roof structures at a minimum of 6/12 pitch. Long rooflines shall be broken up through the use of gables, dormers, or other design elements.
- (8) A means, such as a snow retention system, will be installed to ensure the safety of pedestrians from the dangers of snow falling from roof surfaces onto pedestrians below.
- (9) Roofing colors shall be complementary to and darker than the predominant siding material.
- (10) All exterior materials shall be low maintenance and durable, with resistance to moisture, wind, and sunlight.
- (11) Windows throughout the development shall be generous in size and number to allow for sunlight to enter the interior spaces. Windows shall have a consistent mullion design throughout the development.”

9. **Building Spacing** has been renumbered to Section vii; **Recreation Space** has been renumbered to Section (viii); and **Private Open Space** has been renumbered to Section (ix).

10. **Parking Requirements** has been renumbered to Section (x) and revised to read “there shall be a minimum of .5 parking spaces per dwelling unit, per Table 1276.1. See Chapter 1276 Parking and Site Design.”
11. Section 5(b)(v)(1) **Accessibility Standards** has been added to read “ All housing units shall have at least one accessible entrance. To the extent feasible, all entrances and exterior private spaces for use by residents such as porches, decks, balconies, and walks shall be accessible. Where accessibility to secondary entrances and private spaces is not feasible, there shall not be more than two steps to these areas.”
12. **Building Design Standards** has been renumbered to Section (vi) and subsections (2) through (5) have been revised, along with the addition of subsections (6) through (11) as follows:
 - (1) Buildings shall have a maximum of 4 units attached in a single building.
 - (2) The front façade of each building shall provide a varying shape to break up the face of the building.
 - (3) A single material covering the exterior of a building shall not exceed 50% of the total façade. There shall be a minimum of 3 materials used on the building, one of which must be masonry.
 - (4) Style and materials shall match those used in the West Neighborhood.
 - (5) All overhangs must be a minimum of 12 inches.
 - (6) Earth tones will prevail in the color scheme throughout the East Neighborhood.
 - (7) All roofs will maintain at least a 6/12 pitch. Long rooflines shall be broken up through the use of gables, dormers, or other design elements.
 - (8) Roofing colors shall be complementary to and darker than the predominant siding material.
 - (9) All exterior materials shall be low maintenance and durable, with resistance to moisture, wind, and sunlight.
 - (10) Windows shall be generous in size and number to allow for sunlight to enter the interior spaces. Windows shall have a consistent mullion design throughout the development.
 - (11) Garages shall be designed and located so they are not the dominant visual element of the building or streetscape. All attached garages shall comply with the following:
 - (a) The garage door shall be set back a minimum of 25 feet from the road or sidewalk, whichever is closer, and shall be set back a minimum of 2 feet from the front façade of the building.
 - (b) All attached garages shall be fully integrated into the building mass.
13. **Building Spacing** has been renumbered to Section (vii), **Recreation Space** has been renumbered to Section (viii); and **Private Open Space** has been renumbered to Section (ix).
14. **Parking Requirements** has been renumbered to Section (x) and has been revised as follows: “There shall be a minimum of 2 off-street parking spaces per dwelling

unit, one of which shall be in a garage attached to its corresponding unit. In addition, 1 off-street visitor space per every 5 units shall be provided. See Table 1276.1. See Chapter 1276 Parking and Site Design.

The site plan has been revised from the September 6, 2018 plan to indicate 16 parking spaces measuring 9' wide x 19' long with a 24' wide aisle width, pursuant to Table 1276-3, are located on the south side of the assisted living facility, along with six parking spaces located to the east of the building. The break-away gate at the east end of the property near the Ganyard Avenue and Alice Avenue connection has been moved slightly to the west.

Staff Review Comments:

1. Pursuant to Section 1268.06(b), the establishment of an SPD requires formal amendments to the Zoning Code and Official Zoning Map according to the procedures in Section 6.02 of the City Charter, including the required public hearing. The ordinance enacting the SPD amendments shall include the required findings set forth in Section 1268.05 and shall also adopt by reference the conceptual development plan.
2. As permitted by Section 1278.03(h), the City Engineer requires the coordination of data from the traffic study with adjacent property owners and proposed development sites.

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends approval of the SPD-5 Design Guidelines and to move the discussion plan to a detailed site plan and public hearing, pursuant to Section 1268.06(b).

