Brunswick City Planning Commission

March 5, 2020

7:00 p.m. – Caucus

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Joe Delsanter, Council Representative
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Dev. Director
Melissa Bukowski, Chagrin Valley Engineering
Matt Pisko, Sevan Multi-Site Solutions, 37704 Hills Tech Drive, Farmington Hills, MI

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 7:08 p.m.

The first item was the review of the public hearing for Electronic Restoration Services 8' fence height variance, 1135 Industrial Parkway North. Ms. Plavecski noted the Administration has no issues with the 8' high fence, to which the Planning Commission agreed.

The second item was the discussion of the public hearing for the Jiffy Lube conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan, 3753 Center Road. Regarding screening along the north property line, Mr. Pisko explained they will add a 6' high white vinyl fence, and stated there is existing landscaping to provide screening.

Mr. Arona commented regarding the vote for the Brunswick Lake Park Improvements at the February 20, 2020 Planning Commission meeting, that he abstained from the vote; therefore, the minutes should be revised to read "4 Ayes 0 Nays 1 Abstain (Mr. Arona)." Ms. Plavecski stated she will amend the minutes to reflect this.

Chairman Shirilla adjourned the meeting at 7:23 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

Brunswick City Planning Commission

March 5, 2020

7:30 p.m.

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Joe Delsanter, Council Representative
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Development Director
Melissa Bukowski, Chagrin Valley Engineering
Matt Pisko, Sevan Multi-Site Solutions, 37704 Hills Tech Drive, Farmington Hills, MI
Tom Tekesky, American Fence Company, 3841 Ridge Road Cleveland
Rich Kassouf, New Hope Realty, 4092 Tudor Avenue, Brunswick
Dana Mueller, Electronic Restoration Solutions, 1135 Industrial Parkway North
James Inghram, Electronic Restoration Solutions, same as above
John Herman, 1764 Meadow Drive, Hinckley

Item 1

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 7:36 p.m.

Ms. Plavecski called the roll: 5 present 0 absent.

Item 2

Regarding announcements and correspondence, Ms. Plavecski announced Melissa Bukowski, from Chagrin Valley Engineering, would be filling in for Consulting City Engineer Matt Jones.

Item 3

As discussed at tonight's caucus meeting, Mr. Arona noted a correction should be made to the February 20, 2020 Planning Commission minutes indicating that he abstained from the vote for the Brunswick Lake Park improvements, due to a conflict of interest. Ms. Plavecski stated she will revise the minutes to read "4 Ayes 0 Nays 1 Abstain (Mr. Arona)."

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FROM FEBRUARY 20, 2020 WITH THE ABOVE CORRECTION.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 4(a)

Regarding the public hearing for the Electronic Restoration Services 8' high fence variance, 1135 Industrial Parkway North, Ms. Dana Mueller and Mr. James Inghram, of Electronic Restoration Services; and Mr. Tom Tekesky, of American Fence Company, were present.

Concerning Staff Review Comment 1, Ms. Mueller explained they will be enclosing the existing parking lot to store business and personal vehicles, and commented there have been some problems with theft.

Mr. Shirilla declared the public hearing open; no one appeared, so he declared it closed.

MR. ARONA MOTIONED TO GRANT A VARIANCE TO ALLOW AN 8' HIGH FENCE (7' HIGH CHAIN LINK FENCE TOPPED WITH 1' HIGH BARBED WIRE) FOR ELECTRONIC RESTORATION SERVICES, 1135 INDUSTRIAL PARKWAY NORTH. THE APPLICANT WILL BE STORING BUSINESS AND PERSONAL VEHICLES WITHIN THE ENCLOSED FENCED PARKING LOT.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 4(b)

Concerning the public hearing for the Jiffy Lube conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan, 3753 Center Road, Mr. Matt Pisko, of Sevan Multi-Site Solutions, was present.

The Staff Review Comments were addressed as follows:

1. Sheet C1.31 shows the Center Road entrance drive width of 60.9' at the right-of-way; Table 1276-4 permits a 30' maximum width. Provide the entrance drive width at the curb; the above Table allows a maximum width of 45 feet. As this is an existing driveway, the Planning Commission, pursuant to Section 1276.15(b), may modify the specific standards of this Chapter and approve less restrictive parking or site design improvements in individual, unique situations where such standards are clearly inapplicable. In modifying any requirement of this Chapter, the Commission shall find that the objectives of this Chapter, as stated in Section 1276.01, will be met, that the intent of the specific requirement will be maintained, and that the public interest will be served. The concurring vote of three members of the Planning Commission shall be required to approve a less restrictive improvement. Mr. Pisko stated the 60.9' measurement is the length of a stormwater pipe; not the width of the drive. He said they will comply with the dimensions permitted in Table 1276-4; Ms. Plavecski stated the width of the Center Road right-of-way and curb must be indicated on the site plan.

2. Pursuant to Section 1282.06(a), a 25' wide rear screening yard between the north property line and the residential property on Warren Drive is required; only a width of 17.8' has been provided, which should be indicated on the landscape plan. Three Ash trees from Plant List "A" interspersed with five Wintergreen Barberry shrubs from Plant List "D" are indicated; the above Section requires a double row of shrubs 6' high from Plant List "E". The Planning Commission, as permitted by Section 1282.10(a), may approve a less restrictive landscaping or screening improvement in individual, unique situations where the requirements of this Chapter are clearly inapplicable. In approving less restrictive requirements, the Commission shall find that the purpose of this Chapter, as stated in Section 1282.01, will be met, that the intent of the specific requirement will be maintained, and that the public interest will be served. The concurring vote of three members of the Planning Commission shall be required to modify any of the specific requirements of this Chapter. Mr. Pisko explained there is an existing wood fence along the north property line that will be removed and replaced with a 6' high solid white vinyl fence. After some discussion, Mr. Pisko clarified the existing wood fence is located on the Jiffy Lube site; not on the adjacent residential property.

3. As required by Section 1282.06(e), verify that a minimum of 10% of the total front yard area not used for parking or circulation shall be landscaped with trees, shrubs, planting beds, and/or perennial borders and beds in a design selected by the owner. The above landscaping shall also include a 10' wide landscaping strip with plantings specified in Section 1282.06(g); no trees from Plant Lists "A" or "B", or shrubs from Plant Lists "D" or "E", are shown on the Sheet L1.20 Landscape Plan. Mr. Pisko stated he will comply with the above requirements.

4. A minimum of 160 sq. ft. of interior landscaping shall be provided and indicated on the Sheet L1.20 Landscape Plan, pursuant to Section 1282.8(b)(2). Mr. Pisko said they are planting 830 sq. ft. of interior landscaping.

5. The photometrics plan (Sheet ESP-1.0) shows an average illumination level of 2.9 footcandles for the parking and drive lane, which exceeds the maximum 2.4 footcandles permitted by Section 1276.14(c). The lighting along the north property line, adjacent to the residential district on Warren Drive, complies with the maximum one (1) footcandle permitted by Section 1276.14(d). However, in order to avoid an issue with light trespass onto the residential property, the Administration recommends a zero footcandle lighting level on the north property line. As permitted by Section 1276.15(c), the Planning Commission, by a majority vote of the members in attendance, may impose more restrictive requirements where warranted by conditions on the site, on the adjacent street system, or on adjacent property. Mr. Pisko commented they will comply with code to meet the maximum 2.4 footcandles average illumination level and zero footcandle at the north property line.

   Also, pursuant to Section 1276.14(f), exterior lighting shall be designed and maintained so that glare is not cast on adjacent properties. All luminaires over 10' in

height shall be cut-off types which include shields or other devices which eliminate all light above an angle of 85°, as measured from the nadir of the vertical axis of the light source. Mr. Pisko stated they will add shields to the light fixtures to prevent glare.

6. In accordance with Section 1278.08(e), a color rendering has been submitted of the building façade which incorporates the revisions suggested by the Planning Commission on December 19, 2019, including a greater proportion of split-face block than EIFS; extending the canopy over the window; adding two windows on the side of the building (one faux window, due to the restrooms); utilizing a brown masonry band that will extend around the perimeter of the building; and adding masonry to the top of the windows and doors for further architectural interest. Mr. Pisko noted he will add the two accent down-fixtures to the south elevation, as requested by Mr. Shirilla.

7. Final site plan approval is subject to engineering approval.

Mr. Shirilla declared the public hearing open.

Mr. Rich Kassouf, New Hope Realty, 4092 Tudor Avenue, Brunswick, stated he was involved with the Jiffy Lube project and thanked the Planning Commission for their consideration.

There was no further public comment, so Mr. Shirilla declared the public hearing closed

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE JIFFY LUBE CONDITIONAL ZONING CERTFICATE AND DETAILED SITE PLAN, 3753 CENTER ROAD, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING:

1. THE APPLICANT WILL PROVIDE INFORMATION INDICATING THE CENTER ROAD ENTRANCE DRIVE WIDTH AT THE RIGHT-OF-WAY AND CURB IS IN COMPLIANCE WITH TABLE 1276-4 OF THE ZONING CODE. THESE DIMENSIONS SHALL BE SHOWN ON THE FINAL SITE PLAN.

2. PURSUANT TO SECTION 1282.06(a), A 25’ WIDE REAR SCREENING YARD BETWEEN THE NORTH PROPERTY LINE AND THE RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY ON WARREN DRIVE IS REQUIRED; A WIDTH OF 17.8’ HAS BEEN PROVIDED, WHICH SHOULD BE SHOWN ON THE LANDSCAPE PLAN. THREE ASH TREES FROM PLANT LIST “A” INTERSPERSED WITH FIVE WINTERGREEN BARBERRY SHRUBS FROM PLANT LIST “D” ARE INDICATED; THE ABOVE SECTION REQUIRES A DOUBLE ROW OF SHRUBS 6’ HIGH FROM PLANT LIST “E”. THE APPLICANT HAS STATED THE EXISTING WOOD FENCE WILL BE REMOVED ALONG THE NORTH PROPERTY LINE AND REPLACED WITH A 6’ HIGH SOLID WHITE VINYL FENCE, WHICH SHALL BE SHOWN ON THE FINAL SITE PLAN. THE PLANNING COMMISSION, AS PERMITTED BY SECTION 1282.10(a), MAY APPROVE A LESS RESTRICTIVE LANDSCAPING OR SCREENING IMPROVEMENT IN INDIVIDUAL, UNIQUE SITUATIONS WHERE THE REQUIREMENTS OF THIS CHAPTER ARE CLEARLY INAPPLICABLE. IN APPROVING LESS RESTRICTIVE REQUIREMENTS, THE COMMISSION HAS

FOUND THAT THE PURPOSE OF THIS CHAPTER, AS STATED IN SECTION 1282.01, HAS BEEN MET, THAT THE INTENT OF THE SPECIFIC REQUIREMENT WILL BE MAINTAINED, AND THAT THE PUBLIC INTEREST WILL BE SERVED.

3. AS REQUIRED BY SECTION 1282.06(e), INDICATE ON THE LANDSCAPING PLAN THAT A MINIMUM OF 10% OF THE TOTAL FRONT YARD AREA NOT USED FOR PARKING OR CIRCULATION SHALL BE LANDSCAPED WITH TREES, SHRUBS, PLANTING BEDS, AND/OR PERENNIAL BORDERS AND BEDS IN A DESIGN SELECTED BY THE OWNER. THE ABOVE LANDSCAPING SHALL ALSO INCLUDE A 10' WIDE LANDSCAPING STRIP WITH PLANTINGS SPECIFIED IN SECTION 1282.06(g), INCLUDING TREES FROM PLANT LISTS "A" OR "B", AND SHRUBS FROM PLANT LISTS "D" OR "E".

4. THE APPLICANT HAS STATED THAT 830 SQ. FT. OF INTERIOR LANDSCAPING WILL BE PROVIDED, WHICH MEETS THE MINIMUM 160 SQ. FT. REQUIRED BY SECTION 1282.8(b)(2), AND SHALL BE SHOWN ON THE LANDSCAPE PLAN.

5. THE PHOTOMETRICS PLAN (SHEET ESP-1.0) SHALL BE REVISED TO COMPLY WITH THE AVERAGE ILLUMINATION LEVEL OF 2.4 FOOTCANDLES FOR THE PARKING AND DRIVE LANE, IN COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 1276.14(c). THE LIGHTING LEVEL ALONG THE NORTH PROPERTY LINE, ADJACENT TO THE RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT ON WARREN DRIVE, SHALL BE REDUCED TO ZERO FOOTCANDLE (SECTION 1276.14(d) ALLOWS A MAXIMUM OF ONE FOOTCANDLE) TO AVOID AN ISSUE WITH LIGHT TRESPASS ONTO THE RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY. AS PERMITTED BY SECTION 1276.15(c), THE PLANNING COMMISSION HAS IMPOSED MORE RESTRICTIVE REQUIREMENTS WHERE WARRANTED BY CONDITIONS ON THE ADJACENT PROPERTY.

   ALSO, PURSUANT TO SECTION 1276.14(f), EXTERIOR LIGHTING SHALL BE DESIGNED AND MAINTAINED SO THAT GLARE IS NOT CAST ON ADJACENT PROPERTIES. ALL LUMINAIRES OVER 10' IN HEIGHT SHALL BE CUT-OFF TYPES WHICH INCLUDE SHIELDS OR OTHER DEVICES WHICH ELIMINATE ALL LIGHT ABOVE AN ANGLE OF 85°, AS MEASURED FROM THE NADIR OF THE VERTICAL AXIS OF THE LIGHT SOURCE.

6. IN ACCORDANCE WITH SECTION 1278.08(e), A COLOR RENDERING OF THE BUILDING FAÇADE HAS BEEN SUBMITTED WHICH INCORPORATES THE REVISIONS SUGGESTED BY THE PLANNING COMMISSION ON DECEMBER 19, 2019. TWO ADDITIONAL ACCENT DOWN-LIGHTS SHALL BE ADDED TO THE SIDE (SOUTH) ELEVATION, FOR A TOTAL OF FIVE LIGHTS, TO PROVIDE LIGHTING ON THE CORNERS OF THE BUILDING.

7. FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL IS SUBJECT TO ENGINEERING APPROVAL.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 5

There was no old business.

Item 6

There was no new business.

Item 7

No one appeared at the public comment period.

Item 8

Mr. Delsanter stated there was no Council Representative's Report at this time.

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING.

Mr. Arona seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:17 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

March 5, 2020

Electronic Restoration Services fence
(Site plan review)

Location: 1135 Industrial Parkway North
I-L District

Proposed Use & Background:
An application has been submitted by American Fence, on behalf of Electronic Restoration Services, for property located at 1135 Industrial Parkway North, to install 366 linear feet of an 8' high fence (7' high chain link fence topped with 1' high barbed wire) and 28' wide gates to enclose a portion of the existing concrete parking lot on the east side of the building facing Nationwide Parkway (corner lot). Pursuant to Section 1464.05(c) of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Brunswick, the Planning Commission may grant a variance to allow a maximum height of 8 feet for fences located on a commercial or industrial lot.

Staff Review Comments:
1. Identify what will be stored within the fenced area; Section 1266.06 requires all outdoor storage shall be indicated on a site plan that is approved by the Planning Commission. Pursuant to Section 1266.06(a), outdoor storage shall be screened from view from all streets (including Interstate 71) and from adjacent residential districts. Screening may include building walls, solid fences, mounds, landscaping, or any combination thereof which forms a year-round solid screen.

Staff Recommendations:
Staff recommends approval of the 8' high fence, pending the ruling by the Planning Commission, and provided the above item is addressed.

Jiffy Lube
(Public hearing – conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan)

Location: 3753 Center Road
C-G District

Proposed Use & Background:
The Planning Commission, at their meeting on December 19, 2019, moved the discussion plan to a public hearing for the conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan regarding the 3,064 sq. ft. Jiffy Lube four-bay automotive quick oil change facility. Automobile repair facilities are a conditionally permitted use in the C-G District, pursuant to Section 1260.04(k), subject to Section 1274.08(a), (d), (f), and (g) of the Zoning Code.

Hours of operation will be from 7:00 a.m. to 8:00 p.m. daily, with five to six employees per shift, including one manager. Trip generation is anticipated to be 50 to 60 cars per day.

A notation has been provided on Sheet A-4 which indicates the downspouts will tie into the underground storm sewer, in accordance with Section 304.7.1 of the Property Maintenance Code.

As required by Section 1278.09(d), pedestrian access has been provided with a 5' wide painted crosswalk from the building to the sidewalk on Center Road.

A portion of the Staff Review Comments from the December 19th meeting has been addressed on the detailed site plan as follows:

1. The building has been moved forward to meet the maximum 60' front yard setback permitted by Section 1260.05(a)(2)(B), and all parking for the new structure has been relocated to the rear of the structure; therefore, setback modifications are not required.

2. The Board of Zoning Appeals, at their meeting on January 21, 2020, granted a variance of 15' to allow the proposed Jiffy Lube building to be located 85' from the rear (north) property line, and granted a variance of 89' to allow the dumpster enclosure to be located 11' from the rear (north) property line, where Section 1274.08(a) requires that all structures and activity areas shall be located at least 100' from a residential district (adjacent to residential property on Warren Drive) or from a multi-family property line.

3. There are four service bays; Table 1276-1(d)(7) requires a minimum of two parking spaces per bay, for a total of 8 spaces, and Section 1106.5 of the 2017 Ohio Building Code requires one van-accessible space, which have been provided.

4. There is a minimum 24' wide aisle width for two-way traffic between the parking aisles on the north side of the site, pursuant to Table 1276-3.

5. The raised curb on the east and west sides of the property will remain, so there will be no encroachment onto the adjacent properties.

6. As required by the Fire Department, a 20' wide access has been provided around the site for emergency vehicles.

7. Multiple wall signs are indicated on the building; Sections 1270.07(a) and 1270.05 – Table B permit a maximum of one wall sign per each street frontage, with a maximum size of 250 sq. ft. Variances were granted by the Board of Zoning Appeals on January 21, 2020 to allow the proposed signage.

Staff Review Comments:

1. Sheet C1.31 shows the Center Road entrance drive width of 60.9' at the right-of-way; Table 1276-4 permits a 30' maximum width. Provide the entrance drive width at the

curb; the above Table allows a maximum width of 45 feet. As this is an existing driveway, the Planning Commission, pursuant to Section 1276.15(b), may modify the specific standards of this Chapter and approve less restrictive parking or site design improvements in individual, unique situations where such standards are clearly inapplicable. In modifying any requirement of this Chapter, the Commission shall find that the objectives of this Chapter, as stated in Section 1276.01, will be met, that the intent of the specific requirement will be maintained, and that the public interest will be served. The concurring vote of three members of the Planning Commission shall be required to approve a less restrictive improvement.

2. Pursuant to Section 1282.06(a), a 25' wide rear screening yard between the north property line and the residential property on Warren Drive is required; only a width of 17.8' has been provided, which should be indicated on the landscape plan. Three Ash trees from Plant List "A" interspersed with five Wintergreen Barberry shrubs from Plant List "D" are indicated; the above Section requires a double row of shrubs 6' high from Plant List "E". The Planning Commission, as permitted by Section 1282.10(a), may approve a less restrictive landscaping or screening improvement in individual, unique situations where the requirements of this Chapter are clearly inapplicable. In approving less restrictive requirements, the Commission shall find that the purpose of this Chapter, as stated in Section 1282.01, will be met, that the intent of the specific requirement will be maintained, and that the public interest will be served. The concurring vote of three members of the Planning Commission shall be required to modify any of the specific requirements of this Chapter.

3. As required by Section 1282.06(e), verify that a minimum of 10% of the total front yard area not used for parking or circulation shall be landscaped with trees, shrubs, planting beds, and/or perennial borders and beds in a design selected by the owner. The above landscaping shall also include a 10' wide landscaping strip with plantings specified in Section 1282.06(g); no trees from Plant Lists "A" or "B", or shrubs from Plant Lists "D" or "E", are shown on the Sheet L1.20 Landscape Plan.

4. A minimum of 160 sq. ft. of interior landscaping shall be provided and indicated on the Sheet L1.20 Landscape Plan, pursuant to Section 1282.8(b)(2).

5. The photometrics plan (Sheet ESP-1.0) shows an average illumination level of 2.9 footcandles for the parking and drive lane, which exceeds the maximum 2.4 footcandles permitted by Section 1276.14(c). The lighting along the north property line, adjacent to the residential district on Warren Drive, complies with the maximum one (1) footcandle permitted by Section 1276.14(d). However, in order to avoid an issue with light trespass onto the residential property, the Administration recommends a zero footcandle lighting level on the north property line. As permitted by Section 1276.15(c), the Planning Commission, by a majority vote of the members in attendance, may impose more restrictive requirements where warranted by conditions on the site, on the adjacent street system, or on adjacent property.

Also, pursuant to Section 1276.14(f), exterior lighting shall be designed and maintained so that glare is not cast on adjacent properties. All luminaires over 10' in height shall be cut-off types which include shields or other devices which eliminate all light above an angle of 85°, as measured from the nadir of the vertical axis of the light source.

6. In accordance with Section 1278.08(e), a color rendering of the building façade shall be provided which incorporates the revisions suggested by the Planning Commission on December 19, 2019, including a greater proportion of split-face block than EIFS; extending the canopy over the window; adding two windows on the side of the building (one faux window, due to the restrooms); utilizing a brown masonry band that will extend around the perimeter of the building; and adding masonry to the top of the windows and doors for further architectural interest.

7. Final site plan approval is subject to engineering approval.

Staff Recommendations:
Staff recommends approval of the detailed site plan, provided the above items are addressed.