

Brunswick City Planning Commission

October 7, 2021

6:30 p.m. – Caucus

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Brian Ousley, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Development Director
Nick Hanek, Ward 2 Councilman
Tom Paul, Paul Architects LLC, P.O. Box 377, Chardon
Jason Niedermeyer, Brunswick City Schools, 3643 Center Road,
Brunswick
Ed Shearson, Then Design Architecture, 4135 Erie Street,
Willoughby
Steve Zwolinski, 1482 Harvard Avenue, Brunswick
Virginia Rundle, 4196 Oxford Drive, Brunswick

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 6:37 p.m.

The first item was the review of the discussion plan for the Brunswick Middle School stadium, Phase 4 – visitor seating and additional parking, 1483 Pearl Road. Mr. Shirilla inquired if these items were shown on the Phase 3 site plan; Ms. Plavecski responded no.

The second item was the review of the detailed site plan for the Ber's Heating, Cooling, Plumbing & Electric addition, 1988 Pearl Road. Mr. Rocha commented this company performed work on his house last week; therefore, he is recusing himself from any discussion on this item. Mr. Jones explained the owner purchased the adjacent property to Ber's; if they remain as two separate parcels, then the 20' easement is required. He noted, however, if both properties are consolidated into one parcel, an easement will not be required.

The third item of old business concerning discussion of revisions to Ordinance No. 67-2021 regarding short-term property rentals was withdrawn from the agenda by the Administration.

Mr. Shirilla adjourned the meeting at 6:49 p.m.

Respectfully,
Pamela Plavecski

Brunswick City Planning Commission

October 7, 2021

6:55 p.m.

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Brian Ousley, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Development Director
Tom Paul, Paul Architects LLC, P.O. Box 377, Chardon
Nick Hanek, Ward 2 Councilman
Tom Paul, Paul Architects LLC, P.O. Box 377, Chardon
Jason Niedermeyer, Brunswick City Schools, 3643 Center Road,
Brunswick
Ed Shearson, Then Design Architecture, 4135 Erie Street,
Willoughby
Steve Zwolinski, 1482 Harvard Avenue, Brunswick
Virginia Rundle, 4196 Oxford Drive, Brunswick

Item 1

Chairman Shirilla called the meeting to order at 6:55 p.m.

Ms. Plavecski called the roll: 5 present 0 absent.

Item 2

Regarding announcements or correspondence, Mr. Rocha announced he will be recusing himself from discussion of the Ber's detailed site plan due to a conflict of interest, as work was performed on his house last week by this company.

Item 3

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 16, 2021.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays 2 Abstain (Mr. Shirilla and Mr. Arona).

Item 4(a)

Regarding the discussion plan for the Brunswick Middle School stadium, Phase 4 – visitor seating and additional parking, 1483 Pearl Road, Mr. Ed Shearson, of Then Design Architecture; and Mr. Jason Niedermeyer, Superintendent of Brunswick City Schools, were present.

Mr. Shearson noted the discus field was relocated, as it was too close to the building. He explained he was unable to show Phase 4 on the Phase 3 site plan, as Brunswick City Schools needed to ensure there were sufficient funds to construct Phase 4.

Mr. Niedermeyer commented the home side bleachers of the stadium are serviced from inside the middle school, including the concession stand and restrooms. Mr. Shirilla inquired if the 105 new parking spaces are just for sanctioned school events; Mr. Niedermeyer responded yes; they currently collaborate with Brunswick Youth Sports, who sometimes have their sports events on Saturdays. He stated the middle school is not open on Saturdays, so they have to use “port-a-pots”. He commented it is a long walk to the stadium from the front parking lot. Mr. Shirilla clarified that BYS would use the proposed visitor restrooms; Mr. Niedermeyer answered yes, at which point they are hoping to remove the port-a-pots.

Mr. Arona commented the residents on Princeton Drive were not expecting a parking lot so close to their homes. Mr. Hasan and Mr. Shirilla asked where the 105 number of spaces came from; Mr. Shearson replied this is a tight site and there are not many options, as the new middle school was being constructed while the two former junior high school buildings were still occupied. He explained there are grading and ADA accessibility issues to go through the building to get to the visitors’ side for school functions, and having a parking lot on the visitors’ side alleviates the need to go through the building. Mr. Shirilla inquired about the parking lot pavement level; Mr. Jones replied the pavement is even with the street.

Mr. Shirilla inquired if events at the stadium are during the daytime; Mr. Niedermeyer answered that middle school games are done by 8:00 p.m., but during the fall, it will be dark before that time. Mr. Shirilla stated there should be zero light trespass adjacent to the homes on Princeton Drive in order to protect the residents.

Mr. Arona commented a sidewalk should be added to the new parking lot. Mr. Hasan inquired about the lighting levels; Mr. Shearson distributed a photometrics plan to the Commission indicating one footcandle will not be exceeded adjacent to a residential property line, as required by code. Ms. Plavecski inquired if LED lighting will be used that will have 85° cut-off shields; Mr. Shearson responded yes. Mr. Aungst asked if the lighting will be dimmable; Mr. Niedermeyer answered yes. Mr. Shirilla inquired if the stadium lights will be on when there is not an event; Mr. Niedermeyer answered no, except for security lighting.

Regarding headlights from the new parking lot, Mr. Shirilla stated that year-round screening should be used, instead of only deciduous trees and shrubs. He suggested removing the parking spaces by the north property line, which would eliminate the need for screening in that area.

Concerning access gates, Mr. Shearson noted there are two gates along the drive on the north side of the property; one is a pipe gate where people can walk around it, and the other one is a true gate. He commented that solid screening is not a good idea, as safety forces need to have visibility into the site and suggested they could install plantings tall enough to screen the headlights. Mr. Incorvaia noted this section of the site is in the R-L Low Density Residential District and the Planning Commission has a wide latitude on what to require. Mr. Aungst suggested using a remote-control gate; Mr. Hasan stated he would rather have a solid barrier.

Ms. Plavecski commented she and the Chief Building Official visited the site to see if the Phase 3 required landscaping was installed and noted some of the evergreen trees were not the required height, as per the approved landscaping plan, and that additional landscaping will be necessary along Princeton Drive to screen vehicle headlights coming from the new parking lot.

Mr. Aungst stated a sidewalk should be added along Princeton Drive; Mr. Niedermeyer noted there is no existing sidewalk now and the Brunswick City School District doesn't want to take on that responsibility. Mr. Jones commented an easement is a possibility to provide room for a minimum 4' wide sidewalk. Mr. Shearson stated if they add a sidewalk on Princeton Drive, it would dump kids onto a street with no sidewalk.

Mr. Arona said the Planning Commission should follow the code for screening and let the school district come up with a plan indicating this. He commented the Commission granted a modification on the Phase 3 landscape screening, as it was supposed to be a low activity area, but that has changed. Mr. Arona stated the Commission doesn't want to encourage parking along Princeton Drive.

Mr. Hanek commented that former Superintendent Mike Mayell told City Council that the east side of the site would be more park-like, but that has changed. He said he is getting complaints from residents on Princeton Drive and Oxford Drive, and he would like to have a sidewalk installed to Princeton Drive. Mr. Hanek stated the screening will have to be improved with regard to the residents in the neighborhood, as there are serious concerns.

Mr. Shirilla opened the public comment period.

Mr. Steve Zwolinski, 1482 Harvard Avenue, Brunswick, stated there is a substantial amount of construction noise from the middle school and stadium. He said the bright lights from the stadium illuminate his backyard. He said there is noise on Saturdays and until 9:00 p.m. on weeknights.

Ms. Virginia Rundle, 4196 Oxford Drive, Brunswick, stated she doesn't see the necessity to have a visitors' parking lot and concession stand.

There was no further public comment, so Mr. Shirilla declared the public comment period closed. He stated the noise and light trespass issues need to be taken seriously.

The Staff Review Comments were addressed as follows:

1. The landscaping along the east property line received a modification from the Planning Commission on October 15, 2020; however, due to the installation of the new parking lot at the northeast corner of the site, additional landscaping may be required. Mr. Shirilla commented the screening needs to be significantly enhanced.
2. The detention basin must be modified to handle the new parking lot at the northeast corner of the site or a separate stormwater facility (i.e. underground storage) will be required. Mr. Shearson explained there are significant challenges to make the existing basin larger. He said the dry storm swale will address water quality and quantity, but underground storage may be necessary.
3. How will surface drainage be handled for the new parking lot? Mr. Jones noted sheet flow drainage can be problematic and more details are required.
4. The Fire Department has suggested a gated emergency vehicle access drive off of Princeton Drive, due to life safety concerns. Additionally, two private fire hydrants shall be added to meet the minimum 300' distance between hydrants required by the 2017 Ohio Fire Code. Mr. Jones explained the emergency drive doesn't need to be paved to the standards of a parking lot, but it must support the weight of an ambulance and fire truck. He suggested that turf reinforcing or less pavement could be used and noted gravel drives are not permitted. Mr. Shearson stated they are proposing two fire hydrants on the site; Mr. Jones stated Mr. Shearson should verify that with the Fire Department.
5. Due to a new parking lot being installed at the northeast corner of the site, pedestrian access to Princeton Drive is required, pursuant to Section 1278.09(d). Mr. Shirilla explained that needs to be installed to meet code.
6. As there have been concerns regarding light trespass from the new stadium onto adjacent residential properties, in accordance with Section 1276.14(d), the parking lot lighting shall be designed and maintained to provide a maximum of one footcandle illumination level at a side or rear property line adjacent to a residential use or zoning district. Mr. Shearson had provided a photometrics plan earlier in the meeting to address this issue.

Mr. Incorvaia noted that a modification for the landscaping was granted in Phase 3, but could be revised since changes are being made to the northeast corner of the site.

Regarding a sidewalk to Princeton Drive, Mr. Shearson commented there are not a lot of students walking to the middle school from that street. He noted if there would have been an existing sidewalk on that street, they would have tried to connect to it. In order to address the

above Staff Review Comments, Mr. Shearson requested for the detailed site plan to be moved to the November 18, 2021 meeting, instead of the November 4, 2021 meeting, as originally planned.

Mr. Shearson suggested extending the sidewalk along the south side of the new parking lot and adding a gate. Mr. Jones stated that “No Parking” signs could be installed on Princeton Drive. Mr. Aungst noted if City Council approves the installation of a sidewalk on Princeton Drive, the middle school will be required to have a sidewalk along their frontage. Mr. Shearson commented there are budgetary and safety issues concerning installation of a sidewalk on Princeton Drive. Mr. Jones reiterated that an easement could be granted.

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO MOVE THE DISCUSSION PLAN TO A DETAILED SITE PLAN FOR PHASE 4 OF THE BRUNSWICK MIDDLE SCHOOL STADIUM FOR THE VISITOR SECTION AND ADDITIONAL PARKING, 1483 PEARL ROAD, PROVIDED THAT STAFF REVIEW COMMENTS 1 THROUGH 6, AS STATED ABOVE, WILL BE ADDRESSED, EMPHASIZING LIGHTING AND LANDSCAPING ALONG THE NORTH AND EAST PROPERTY LINES, AND PEDESTRIAN CONNECTIVITY TO PRINCETON DRIVE.

Mr. Arona seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 4(b)

Concerning the detailed site plan for the Ber’s Heating, Cooling, Plumbing & Electric addition, 1988 Pearl Road, Mr. Tom Paul, architect, was present.

The Staff Review Comments were addressed as follows:

1. Pursuant to Section 1278.08(e), the existing building façade shall match the new addition as part of the Phase 2 improvements; provide a time frame as to when this will be performed. As the owner was not in attendance to provide a time frame, the Planning Commission agreed that façade improvements shall be completed no later than three months after a certificate of occupancy has been issued for the addition.
2. Regarding the 20’ drainage easement on the adjacent property, the applicant has stated he has purchased this property. Documentation shall be provided to show ownership of this parcel. Mr. Paul stated Jesse Warren (Ber’s owner) purchased the adjacent property, so an easement isn’t required. Mr. Jones asked if Mr. Warren is going to consolidate both lots. He explained the 20’ easement will be required if the adjacent property remains as a separate parcel; however, it will not be required if both properties are consolidated into one parcel
3. Final site plan approval is subject to engineering approval.

MR. ARONA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE DETAILED SITE PLAN FOR THE BER’S HEATING, COOLING, PLUMBING & ELECTRIC ADDITION, 1988 PEARL ROAD, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING:

1. PURSUANT TO SECTION 1278.08(e), THE EXISTING BUILDING FAÇADE SHALL MATCH THE NEW ADDITION AS PART OF THE PHASE 2 IMPROVEMENTS, WHICH SHALL BE COMPLETED NO LATER THAN THREE MONTHS AFTER A CERTIFICATE OF OCCUPANCY HAS BEEN ISSUED FOR THE ADDITION.
2. REGARDING THE 20' DRAINAGE EASEMENT ON THE ADJACENT PROPERTY, THE APPLICANT HAS PURCHASED THIS PROPERTY, FOR WHICH DOCUMENTATION SHALL BE PROVIDED TO SHOW OWNERSHIP. THE ABOVE EASEMENT WILL BE REQUIRED IF THE ADJACENT PROPERTY REMAINS AS A SEPARATE PARCEL; HOWEVER, IT WILL NOT BE REQUIRED IF BOTH PROPERTIES ARE CONSOLIDATED INTO ONE PARCEL, FOR WHICH A MINOR SUBDIVISION APPLICATION IS NECESSARY.
3. FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL IS SUBJECT TO ENGINEERING APPROVAL.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 4 Ayes 0 Nays 1 Abstain (Mr. Rocha).

Item 5

Regarding old business of the discussion of revisions to Ordinance No. 67-2021 regarding short-term rental properties, Ms. Plavecski stated the Administration asked for this item to be removed from tonight's agenda, as further changes are being made.

Item 6

There was no new business.

Item 7

No one appeared at the public comment period.

Item 8

Mr. Ousley stated there was no Council Representative's Report at this time.

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.
The meeting was adjourned at 9:37 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

October 7, 2021

Brunswick Middle School stadium – visitor section and additional parking (Discussion plan)

Location: 1483 Pearl Road
C-G and R-L Districts

Proposed Use & Background:

An application has been submitted to construct visitor bleachers containing 439 seats on the east side of the stadium track as part of Phase 4 for the Brunswick Middle School stadium. Additionally, a 105-space parking lot will be installed at the northeast corner of the site near Princeton Drive. Pursuant to Table 1276-3, the parking stalls measure 9' wide by 19' long with a 24' aisle width between the rows of parking. Five handicap spaces, including one van-accessible space, have been provided in compliance with Table 1106.1 and Section 1106.5 of the 2017 Ohio Building Code.

Further site improvements on the east side of the track include a 1,904 sq. ft. building containing a ticket booth, concession stand, restrooms and storage. This structure will be constructed with a standing seam metal roof and split-face block in two shades of earth-tone colors, which will match the existing middle school.

A 6' high chain link fence will surround the parking lot, and a mowable dry storm swale is located on the east side of the parking lot.

At their meeting on October 15, 2020, as part of the Phase 3 improvements, the Planning Commission approved the revised landscape plan (Sheet L100) received on October 9, 2020, which indicates the landscaping along the north side of the stadium will consist of groupings of 6' high columnar blue spruce trees, along with a grouping of three 7' high white fir pine trees, in compliance with the minimum 6' height required by Section 1282.04(b)(2), in conjunction with the existing trees. Pursuant to Section 1282.04(b)(1), the east property line near Princeton Drive will be planted with a combination of 2.5" caliper "Celebration" maple trees and 2.5" caliper "Heritage River" birch trees from Plant List "A". The spacing for the maple and birch trees is 35' on-center, as required by Section 1282.06(d), and the applicant has verified the screening yard is a minimum 15' wide.

The east property line will be bordered by a 6' high black vinyl chain link fence. Section 1282.04(a) does not allow a chain link fence, with or without slats, to be used as part of the landscaping or screening requirements stated in Section 1282.06(d). In order to provide visibility for safety forces into the middle school site, on October 15, 2020, the Planning Commission, as permitted by Section 1282.10(a), granted a modification to waive Sections 1282.04(a) and 1282.04(e), which requires a continuous solid barrier in the form of landscaping or a solid fence. Additionally, at the October 20, 2020 meeting, in accordance

with Section 1278.09(d), it was determined there is current or proposed pedestrian access to Pearl Road and Manhattan Avenue. As safe pedestrian connectivity to Princeton Drive could not be provided, the Planning Commission voted that a sidewalk along Princeton Drive was not required.

Staff Review Comments:

1. The landscaping along the east property line received a modification from the Planning Commission on October 15, 2020; however, due to the installation of the new parking lot at the northeast corner of the site, additional landscaping may be required on the north and east property lines.
2. The detention basin must be modified to handle the new parking lot at the northeast corner of the site or a separate stormwater facility (i.e. underground storage) will be required.
3. How will surface drainage be handled for the new parking lot?
4. The Fire Department has suggested a gated emergency vehicle access drive off of Princeton Drive, due to life safety concerns. Additionally, two private fire hydrants shall be added to meet the minimum 300' distance between hydrants required by the 2017 Ohio Fire Code.
5. Due to a new parking lot being installed at the northeast corner of the site, pedestrian access to Princeton Drive is required, pursuant to Section 1278.09(d).
6. As there have been concerns regarding light trespass from the new stadium onto adjacent residential properties, in accordance with Section 1276.14(d), the parking lot lighting shall be designed and maintained to provide a maximum of one footcandle illumination level at a side or rear property line adjacent to a residential use or zoning district.

Staff Recommendations:

Staff withholds recommendation until the above items are addressed.

Ber's Heating, Cooling, Plumbing & Electric addition

(Detailed site plan)

Location: 1988 Pearl Road
C-G General Commercial District

Proposed Use & Background:

The Planning Commission, at their meeting on September 2, 2021, moved the discussion plan to a detailed site plan to construct an 8,000 sq. ft. two-story addition (4,000 sq. ft. on each floor) on the west (rear) side of the existing 4,077 sq. ft. one-story building, for a total of

12,077 sq. ft. The first floor will be used primarily for storage and the second floor will contain offices and a conference room.

At the above meeting, the Planning Commission granted the following modifications:

1. As this is an existing site, the applicant is unable to provide the 10' wide landscape strip required by Section 1282.06(e) along the Pearl Road right-of-way and can only install a 4.5' width. However, as 1,940 sq. ft. of new landscaping is being installed to improve the site, and due to this being an existing condition, the Planning Commission, as permitted by Section 1282.10(a), approved the 4.5' width.
2. Section 1282.06(g) requires trees from Plant List "A" 25' to 35' on-center with a row of shrubs from Plant Lists "D" or "E", or trees from Plant List "B" 20' to 30' on-center with a row of shrubs from Plant Lists "D" or "E" to be planted in a 10' landscape strip adjacent to the Pearl Road right-of-way. As there is only a 4.5' wide screening strip in this area, as stated in Item 1 above, there is insufficient room to plant the above trees; however, the shrubs from Plant Lists "D" or "E" will be installed. The Planning Commission, as permitted by Section 1282.10(a), has granted a modification to waive the requirement of installing trees from Plant Lists "A" or "B".

A photometrics plan was submitted with the discussion plan on September 2, 2021, whereby the average illumination level of 2.0 footcandles complies with the maximum 2.4 footcandles permitted by Section 1276.14(c).

A majority of the Staff Review Comments from the September 2nd meeting have been addressed as follows:

1. In compliance with Section 1282.08((b)(2) regarding interior landscaping, two Azur maple trees are shown and the species and quantity of the shrubs have been identified on the detailed site plan, which meets the minimum 16 shrubs required from Plant Lists "D" or "E".
2. A five foot (5') wide parking perimeter landscape strip is indicated on the north and south sides of the rear parking lot, pursuant to Section 1282.08(a), which includes the species and minimum 3' height of the shrubs, pursuant to Section 1282.04(b)(3).
3. In compliance with Table 1276-4, the revised site plan shows a 45' width at the curb for the north drive and a 30' width at the south drive.
4. On the discussion plan, the dimensions of the five 60° angled parking spaces on the north side of the site measured 16.1' long by 9.7' wide, with a 29.2' width for two-way traffic. The aisle width complied with the minimum 24' width required by Table 1276-3, but the parking space length did not meet the minimum 21' required by the above Table. Therefore, the applicant has revised the site plan whereby the parking spaces will be 90° angle, measuring 9' wide by 19' long, with a 27.3' aisle width, in compliance

with the above Table. One additional parking space has been added in this area, for a total of 28 spaces on the site, which meets the minimum 25 spaces required by Table 1276-1(d)(2).

5. The landscape plan (Sheet LS-1.0) indicates that 846 sq. ft. of interior landscaping will be provided, in compliance with Section 1282.08(b), which requires a minimum of 540 sq. ft.
6. Pursuant to Section 1278.08(e), the existing building façade shall match the new addition as part of the Phase 2 improvements. A revised color rendering in earth-tone colors has been submitted indicating this, along with the street view showing the portion of the second story addition that will be visible from Pearl Road.

Staff Review Comments:

1. Pursuant to Section 1278.08(e), the existing building façade shall match the new addition as part of the Phase 2 improvements; provide a time frame as to when this will be performed.
2. Regarding the 20' drainage easement on the adjacent property, the applicant has stated he has purchased this property. Documentation shall be provided to show ownership of this parcel.
3. Final site plan approval is subject to engineering approval.

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends approval of the detailed site plan, provided the above items have been addressed.

