

Brunswick City Planning Commission

November 17, 2022 – Caucus

6:30 p.m.

Brad Saeger, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Joe Delsanter, Council Representative
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Development Director
Jennie Lods, BZA Secretary & Planning & Zoning Coordinator
trainee
Ed Begue, Baker Bednar Snyder & Associates, 628 Niles Cortland
Road S.E., Suite 201, Warren
Nate Zampelli, general contractor (no address given)
Dale Haywood, Atwell Group, 7100 E. Pleasant Valley Road,
Suite 220, Independence
Ryan Fuerst, Atwell Group, same as above
Patrick O'Hara, Liberty Ford, 3101 Center Road, Brunswick

Vice Chairman Brad Saeger called the meeting to order at 6:38 p.m.

The first item was the review of the discussion plan for the Liberty Ford service garage addition, 3101 Center Road. Mr. Hasan stated he is concerned about the visibility of east elevation facing the I-71 off-ramp, in addition to the north elevation, and commented further architectural enhancements should be added to those elevations, to which Mr. Saeger concurred.

Regarding building signage, Mr. Hasan questioned if the off-ramp would be counted as a street; Mr. Aungst responded yes.

Mr. Saeger adjourned the meeting at 6:47 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

Brunswick City Planning Commission

November 17, 2022

6:50 p.m.

Brad Saeger, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Joe Delsanter, Council Representative
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Development Director
Jennie Lods, BZA Secretary & Planning & Zoning Coordinator
trainee
Ed Begue, Baker Bednar Snyder & Associates, 628 Niles Cortland
Road S.E., Suite 201, Warren
Nate Zampelli, general contractor (no address given)
Dale Haywood, Atwell Group, 7100 E. Pleasant Valley Road,
Suite 220, Independence
Ryan Fuerst, Atwell Group, same as above
Patrick O'Hara, Liberty Ford, 3101 Center Road, Brunswick

Item 1

Vice Chairman Brad Saeger called the meeting to order at 6:50 p.m.

MR. SAEGER MOTIONED TO EXCUSE CHAIRMAN JOE SHIRILLA AND JEFF ARONA FOR JUST CAUSE.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays.

Ms. Lods called the roll: 3 Present 2 Absent. (Mr. Shirilla and Mr. Arona).

Item 2

There were no announcements or correspondence.

Item 3

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF OCTOBER 20, 2022.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 4(a)

Regarding the Liberty Ford service garage addition discussion plan, 3101 Center Road, Mr. Dale Haywood, and Mr. Ryan Fuerst, of Atwell Group; Mr. Ed Begue, of Baker Bednar Snyder & Associates; Mr. Nate Zampelli, general contractor; and Mr. Patrick O'Hara, of Liberty Ford, were present.

Mr. Begue stated the service garage will be fully fire suppressed (sprinklered). He explained the building is not intended for public use; however, three EV charging stations are located on the south side of the structure for public use. He noted there will be no signage on the south elevation, as the service garage will be used by employees. Mr. O'Hara noted Ford is requiring them to have public EV charging stations.

The Staff Review Comments were addressed as follows:

1. The ten new parking spaces on the south side of the new service garage are 9' wide, pursuant to Table 1276-3; verify they have a minimum 19' length. Mr. Begue stated the parking spaces will comply with that length, which will be shown on the detailed site plan.
2. A dumpster enclosure is indicated on the east side of the site; verify it is not located within the minimum 25' side yard setback required by Section 1258.04(c). Additionally, confirm the dumpster enclosure will be constructed with materials comparable to the building, pursuant to Section 1276.12(a). Mr. Begue stated the enclosure does not encroach into the 25' side yard setback and will be constructed with split-face block comparable to the service garage. Ms. Plavecski stated this shall be shown on the detailed site plan.
3. Mr. Begue stated a photometrics plan indicating a minimum 0.6 footcandle level for the ten new parking spaces on the south side of the service garage, as required by Section 1276.14(a), will be submitted with the detailed site plan.
4. Any additional interior landscaping shall meet the requirements of Section 1282.08(b), to which Mr. Begue agreed.
5. Per Fire Department requirements, two additional fire hydrants shall be added on opposite ends of the building to meet the minimum 300' distance between hydrants. Mr. Begue reiterated the service garage will be fully sprinklered and didn't see the need for the two new fire hydrants. Mr. Jones explained the Fire Department is requiring them; to which Mr. Aungst concurred.
6. Six landscape islands are proposed to be removed from the site, but only three new ones are proposed to be added. Indicate the net additional acreage of impervious surface that will result from the new island configuration, and verify that the underground retention system will still meet the City's stormwater management requirements after adding the additional impervious surface to the site. Mr. Haywood stated they will supply summary stormwater calculations.

7. Additional architectural enhancements shall be added to the north and south building elevations, in accordance with Section 1278.08(c). Also, provide building material samples to ensure compatibility with the existing main building, as required by Section 1278.08(e). Mr. Saeger commented Liberty Ford is located at one of the gateways to the city and stated the Planning Commission is concerned about the appearance of the east elevation (facing I-71 off-ramp) and the south elevation (facing Center Road), to which Mr. Hasan agreed. Mr. Saeger suggested adding up/down lighting sconces, to these elevations; Mr. Begue concurred. Mr. Saeger also requested that architectural enhancements should be added to the north elevation. Mr. Hasan noted the five lights over the eight bays on the west elevation should be more evenly spaced to provide symmetry. Mr. Saeger suggested adding accent colors on the east elevation, in addition to adding wall sconces; Mr. Begue agreed. Mr. Hasan suggested that accent colors should also be added on the north elevation.

Mr. Seager noted there are tires being stored outside of the building, which is not permitted. Mr. Aungst inquired, as no wall signs are being installed on the south elevation, what architectural features will be used there instead? Mr. Zampelli replied they will work with Mr. O'Hara on this. Mr. Delsanter commented the accent lighting should be sufficient to enhance the building; Mr. Zampelli stated they could add sconces on all sides of the service garage. Mr. Hasan suggested the south elevation could be broken up with faux windows, color accents, and lighting.

8. The proposed sign on the south elevation measures 245 sq. ft. As there is an existing wall sign facing Center Road on the main building, this will result in a second wall sign, which is not permitted by Table 1270.05 - B; therefore, a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals will be necessary. If the above variance is not granted, whereby the proposed sign is removed, additional architectural features shall be added to break up the long expanse of blank wall, pursuant to Section 1278.08(c). Additionally, all signs shall comply with Chapter 1270; Section 1270.14(a) states where a nonconforming sign(s) exists on the property subject to a permit application, no permit shall be issued until such time as such nonconforming sign(s) is made to conform with the requirements of this Chapter. Mr. Begue reiterated no new signage is being added on the service garage, as it is not for public use. Mr. Aungst stated, per Ordinance No. 72-2021, adopted September 27, 2021, that all signage on the site must comply with Chapter 1270.
9. There is an existing shed located behind the main building; will it be removed? Mr. O'Hara responded that hasn't yet been determined.

Mr. Saeger stated Mr. Arona, who was unable to attend tonight's meeting, had the following questions:

1. Why isn't the service garage tucked behind the building?

2. Why was this location chosen?

Mr. Begue replied there is an underground stormwater management system behind the building and due to site grading, this is the best location.

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO MOVE THE DISCUSSION PLAN TO A DETAILED SITE PLAN AND PUBLIC HEARING ON THE CONDITIONAL ZONING CERTIFICATE FOR THE LIBERTY FORD SERVICE GARAGE, 3101 CENTER ROAD, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING:

THE APPLICANT WILL COMPLY WITH STAFF REVIEW COMMENTS 1 THROUGH 4, WHICH SHALL BE SHOWN ON THE DETAILED SITE PLAN. THE APPLICANT WILL WORK WITH THE FIRE DEPARTMENT REGARDING THE LOCATION OF THE TWO ADDITIONAL FIRE HYDRANTS. THE APPLICANT SHALL COMPLY WITH STAFF REVIEW COMMENT 6 AND PROVIDE SUMMARY STORMWATER MANAGEMENT CALCULATIONS. IN COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF REVIEW COMMENT 7, ADDITIONAL ARCHITECTURAL ENHANCEMENTS, SUCH AS WALL SCONCES, SHALL BE ADDED ON THE NORTH, SOUTH, AND EAST ELEVATIONS OF THE SERVICE GARAGE. PER STAFF REVIEW COMMENT 8, NO NEW SIGNAGE IS BEING ADDED TO THE BUILDING. ALL EXISTING SIGNS SHALL CONFORM TO CHAPTER 1270. AS NOTED IN STAFF REVIEW COMMENT 9, THE DISPOSITION OF THE EXISTING SHED WILL BE INDICATED ON THE DETAILED SITE PLAN. ALL OUTDOOR TIRE STORAGE SHALL BE REMOVED.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 5

There was no old business.

Item 6

Regarding the proposed 2023 Planning Commission Meeting Schedule, Mr. Rocha stated he is unable to attend the February 16, 2023 meeting. Mr. Saeger stated he is unable to attend the July 13 and October 5, 2023 meetings.

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO ADOPT THE PLANNING COMMISSION 2023 MEETING SCHEDULE.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 7

No one appeared at the public comment period. Regarding the outdoor tire storage at Liberty Ford, Mr. Incorvaia stated no outdoor storage is permitted in the C-H Highway Interchange Commercial District.

Item 8

Mr. Delsanter gave the Council Representative's Report. He commented the City Council Planning & Zoning Committee is working on drafting legislation for a Designated Outdoor Refreshment Area (DORA).

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:40 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

November 17, 2022

Liberty Ford service garage

(Discussion plan)

Location: 3101 Center Road
C-H District

Proposed Use & Background:

A discussion plan has been submitted to construct a 20,192 sq. ft. service garage on the east side of the existing parking lot addition that was approved by the Planning Commission on April 7, 2011. Fourteen (14) service bays are proposed; seven each on the west and east elevations.

Automotive repair garages are a conditionally permitted use in the C-H District, pursuant to Section 1258.03(h), subject to Section 1274.08(a), (d), (f), and (g) of the Zoning Code. There are no adjacent residential properties to the site; therefore, the 100' setback requirement for a commercial structure from a residential or multifamily property line is not applicable in this instance.

Table 1276-1(d)(7) requires a minimum of 28 parking spaces; 29 employee parking spaces are notated on Sheet 1. Three electric vehicle charging stations are shown on the south side of service garage as part of the ten new spaces being installed in that area. There is a 30' aisle width between the new row of parking and the existing parking lot, which meets the minimum 24' aisle width required by Table 1276-3.

Pursuant to Section 1274.11(c), all areas used for vehicle display and areas used for customer, employee and other short-term parking and circulation shall be shown on the site plans approved by the Planning Commission for this purpose and shall be paved according to the requirements of Chapter 1276. With Commission approval, areas for vehicle storage may be unpaved. Parking areas designated for display or inventory may depart from the required standards for design of parking spaces and aisles in Chapter 1276. Sheet C3.0 indicates total site parking of 58 employee spaces; 35 customer spaces; 4 employee/customer handicap spaces; 712 inventory spaces on the main lot; and 94 inventory spaces on the side lot, for a total of 903 spaces. Construction of the service garage will result in removing 123 existing spaces and adding 10 new spaces, for a net loss of 113 spaces.

The building will be constructed with a standing seam metal roof, vertical metal siding on the upper portion of the building, and split-face block on the lower half. The façade will incorporate white metal wall panels to match the existing service department white walls, and gray split-face block wainscot, roof, gutters and downspouts to match the gray accent colors on the existing showroom, in compliance with Section 1278.08(e).

Staff Review Comments:

1. The ten new parking spaces on the south side of the new service garage are 9' wide, pursuant to Table 1276-3; verify they have a minimum 19' length.
2. A dumpster enclosure is indicated on the east side of the site; verify it is not located within the minimum 25' side yard setback required by Section 1258.04(c). Additionally, confirm the dumpster enclosure will be constructed with materials comparable to the building, pursuant to Section 1276.12(a).
3. The detailed site plan shall include a photometrics plan indicating a minimum 0.6 footcandle level for the ten new parking spaces on the south side of the service garage, as required by Section 1276.14(a).
4. Any additional interior landscaping shall meet the requirements of Section 1282.08(b).
5. Per Fire Department requirements, two additional fire hydrants shall be added on opposite ends of the building to meet the minimum 300' distance between hydrants.
6. Six landscape islands are proposed to be removed from the site, but only three new ones are proposed to be added. Indicate the net additional acreage of impervious surface that will result from the new island configuration, and verify that the underground retention system will still meet the City's stormwater management requirements after adding the additional impervious surface to the site.
7. Additional architectural enhancements shall be added to the north and south building elevations, in accordance with Section 1278.08(c). Also, provide building material samples to ensure compatibility with the existing main building, as required by Section 1278.08(e).
8. The proposed sign on the south elevation measures 245 sq. ft., which exceeds the maximum 200 sq. ft. permitted by Section 1270.05 – Table B. As there is an existing wall sign facing Center Road on the main building, this will result in a second wall sign, which is not permitted by the above Table; therefore, variances from the Board of Zoning Appeals will be necessary. If the above variances are not granted, whereby the proposed sign is removed, additional architectural features shall be added to break up the long expanse of blank wall, pursuant to Section 1278.08(c). Additionally, all signs shall comply with Chapter 1270; Section 1270.14(a) states where a nonconforming sign(s) exists on the property subject to a permit application, no permit shall be issued until such time as such nonconforming sign(s) is made to conform with the requirements of this Chapter.
9. There is an existing shed located behind the main building; will it be removed?

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends moving the discussion plan to a detailed site plan and public hearing for the conditional zoning certificate, provided the above items are addressed.