Brunswick City Planning Commission

November 17, 2016 - Caucus

7:00 p.m.

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brian Ousley, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Dev. Director
Maryann Chandler, 3492 Brunswick Lake Parkway, Brunswick

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 7:04 p.m.

The first item was the review of the discussion site plan for the Bullseye Activewear & Promotions addition, 2947 Nationwide Parkway. Ms. Plavecski noted the parking space dimensions are indicated at 10' x 18' long; Section 1276.10(c) allows that not more than two feet of the 19' stall depth required by Table 1276-3 may extend across the curb or bumper guard into an unpaved overhang area, provided that vehicles will not extend across a property line, right-of-way line or public sidewalk. The seven spaces on the west side of the building will need to be extended to a 19' length.

The second item was the discussion of the detailed site plan for Brunswick Comfort Inn & Suites (former Wallhouse Hotel), 1464 Town Center Boulevard, Southeast Neighborhood, Brunswick Town Center SPD-2. Ms. Plavecski commented the conference room that was previously approved by the Planning Commission is missing from the detailed site plan. Mr. Jones noted that the site plan on Sheet C3 doesn't match Sheet C1, which was also previously approved. He also commented that Sheet C4 should not be part of the submittal, as the proposed Brixmor parking improvements on the Town Center Boulevard bulb have not been approved. Mr. Shirilla commented the hotel should be unique and boutique-style; not like a hotel that is next to a freeway interchange. Mr. Arona commented the colors of the proposed Comfort Inn may blend better with the buildings in Town Center than the Wallhouse colors. Mr. Aungst noted the rooms at the Wallhouse Hotel all had balconies. Mr. Shirilla stated the hotel should have architectural elements of interest, as stated in the "Type X" hotel design guidelines.

The third item was the review of old business concerning the revised site plan for North Park Plaza, 3459 Center Road. Mr. Jones explained the 18' long parking spaces on the north side of the site are satisfactory, instead of the required 19' length, because a 2' overhang is

allowed. However, he noted the 18' length on the south side does not have an overhang, due to the retaining wall. He suggested adding rubber bumper guards, which are usually located one foot from the rear of the space, to keep cars from hitting the retaining wall. He said this would actually reduce the length to 16'.

Due to time constraints, the 2017 Planning Commission Meeting Schedule was not discussed in the caucus meeting.

Mr. Shirilla adjourned the meeting at 7:35 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

Brunswick City Planning Commission

November 17, 2016

7:30 p.m.

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brian Ousley, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Dev. Director
Bill McCullough, P.O. Box 9578, Canton
Jim Heiser, Bullseye Activewear, 2947 Nationwide Parkway, Brunswick
Rhonda Singer, Stark Enterprises, 1350 West Third Street, Cleveland
Hank Rapport, Stark Enterprises, same
Brad Saeger, 1421 McKinley Avenue, Brunswick
Chase Saeger, 1421 McKinley Avenue, Brunswick
Don Morgan, no address given

Item 1

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 7:41 p.m.

Item 2

Regarding announcements or correspondence, Ms. Plavecski announced that Ms. Pat Garn, 688 Camden Lane, came to the Division of Building on November 17th to state she is not in favor of the Comfort Inn and would like to have the Wallhouse Hotel, as was originally proposed. She said she is unable to attend the November 17th Planning Commission meeting and would like her opinion forwarded to them.

Item 3

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 3, 2016.

Mr. Arona seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays 1 Abstain (Mr. Arona).

Item 4(a)

Regarding the discussion site plan for the Bullseye Activewear & Promotions addition, 2947 Nationwide Parkway, Mr. Jim Heiser, owner; and Mr. Bill McCullough, architect, were present.

Mr. Heiser explained the addition will be used for storage of garments. He noted they will extend the length of the seven parking spaces on the west side of the building and they will comply with the four Staff Review Comments, which will be submitted with the detailed site plan.

MR. ARONA MOTIONED TO MOVE THE DISCUSSION SITE PLAN TO A DETAILED SITE PLAN FOR THE BULLSEYE ACTIVEWEAR AND PROMOTIONS ADDITION, 2947 NATIONWIDE PARKWAY, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING:

1. THE SEVEN (7) PARKING SPACES ON THE WEST SIDE OF THE BUILDING WILL BE EXTENDED TO A 19' LENGTH, PURSUANT TO SECTION 1276.10(c).

2. THE DETAILED SITE PLAN SHALL INDICATE THAT GUTTERS AND DOWNSPOUTS FOR THE PROPOSED ADDITION SHALL TIE INTO A PUBLIC STORM SEWER, AS REQUIRED BY SECTION 304.7.1 OF THE PROPERTY MAINTENANCE CODE.

3. PERFORMANCE STANDARDS, PURSUANT TO SECTION 1266.07, SHALL BE SUBMITTED WITH THE DETAILED SITE PLAN.

4. A PHOTOMETRICS PLAN, IN COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 1276.14(a), SHALL BE SUBMITTED WITH THE DETAILED SITE PLAN INDICATING A MINIMUM 0.6 FOOTCANDLE LIGHTING LEVEL FOR PARKING AND PEDESTRIAN AREAS.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 4 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 4(b)

Concerning the detailed site plan for the Brunswick Comfort Inn & Suites (former Wallhouse Hotel), 1464 Town Center Boulevard, Southeast Neighborhood, Brunswick Town Center SPD-2, the applicant was not in attendance.

Ms. Plavecski commented the detailed site plan does not include a conference room, which is a requirement of the "Type X Buildings: Hotel" Design Guidelines, that was indicated on the discussion plan. Mr. Jones noted that Sheet C1 indicates the driveway to Brunswick Lake Apartments extending off the east side of the proposed hotel parking lot, as previously approved; Sheet C3 does not have the correct layout. He further explained that Sheet C4 should be eliminated from the detailed site plan, as the proposed Brixmor parking layout for the Town Center Boulevard bulb has not been approved. Mr. Jones said the submittal is

incomplete, as it doesn't include any grading or utility details. Mr. Hasan stated a color rendering of the hotel would have been helpful.

Mr. Shirilla commented he is greatly disappointed with the detailed site plan that has been presented and explained the Planning Commission and Administration spent a significant amount of time working with applicant on the site plan and façade for the Wallhouse Hotel. Mr. Shirilla said this does not merit being classified as a detailed site plan and is significantly lacking as to meeting the standards of the "Type X Hotel" buildings.

Mr. Shirilla opened the public comment period.

Mrs. Maryann Chandler, 3492 Brunswick Lake Parkway, stated it has been two years to the day that the hotel discussion plan was being reviewed. She said the "Type X Buildings: Hotel" Design Guidelines are lacking, and hotels should be classified as a conditionally permitted use, instead of a permitted use, in the Southeast Neighborhood of Brunswick Town Center. She said this plan should be denied and the applicant should start over with a new plan. She noted the original intent of the SPD-2 was for buildings to face Brunswick Lake to take advantage of the view; they should not be oriented towards Town Center Boulevard. Mrs. Chandler noted that Sections (C)(1) and (C)(2) Design Intent of the "Type X Buildings" conflict; she said the original intent was for the hotel to face Brunswick Lake.

There was no further public comment, so Mr. Shirilla declared the public comment period closed.

Mr. Shirilla stated the hotel should be developed according to the "Type X" Design Guidelines and he would support rejecting the plan, to which Mr. Arona concurred. Mr. Arona stated the hotel should face Brunswick Lake. Mr. Hasan also agreed that Sections (C)(1) and (C)(2) are conflicting sections; Mr. Jones said with some creative design, the hotel could be oriented to meet both of these sections. Mr. Shirilla commented the "Type X" Guidelines are at least a starting point to review the proposed hotel; previously, there were no guidelines.

Mr. Incorvaia explained, pursuant to Section 1278.03(e)(2), there is a time constraint. He stated the Planning Commission has 21 days to schedule the detailed site plan for a future meeting, provided the applicant agrees to it. He noted since no applicant is present, that will not be possible.

MR. ARONA MOTIONED TO DISAPPROVE THE BRUNSWICK COMFORT INN & SUITES (FORMER WALLHOUSE HOTEL) DETAILED SITE PLAN, 1464 TOWN CENTER BOULEVARD, SOUTHEAST NEIGHBORHOOD OF BRUNSWICK TOWN CENTER SPD-2, PURSUANT TO SECTION 1278.03(e)(2), FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

1. AT THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD HELD ON THE ABOVE DATE, THE PLANNING COMMISSION WAS PRESENTED WITH SIGNIFICANT EVIDENCE FROM INDIVIDUAL VERBAL TESTIMONY THAT THE DETAILED SITE PLAN DOES NOT MEET THE "TYPE X BUILDINGS: HOTEL" DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR THE SOUTHEAST NEIGHBORHOOD OF BRUNSWICK TOWN CENTER SPD-2. THE

APPLICANT DID NOT PRESENT ANY EVIDENCE OR TESTIMONY TO THE CONTRARY (DID NOT ATTEND THE MEETING).

2. SECTION 1278.03(d) STATES THE DETAILED SITE PLAN SHALL INCLUDE, UNLESS WAIVED BY THE PLANNING COMMISSION AS NOT BEING APPLICABLE, ALL DATA, PLANS AND SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS REQUIRED BY THE APPLICABLE ZONING DISTRICT AND/OR LISTED ON APPLICATION MATERIALS MAINTAINED FOR THAT PURPOSE BY THE COMMISSION. THE DETAILED SITE PLAN IS MISSING THESE ITEMS, I.E., THE MINIMUM 5' WIDE PARKING PERIMETER LANDSCAPING STRIPS REQUIRED BY SECTION 1282.08(a) ON THE NORTH, SOUTH AND EAST PARKING LOTS; THE AMOUNT OF INTERIOR LANDSCAPING (2,100 SQ. FT. MINIMUM REQUIRED BY SECTION 1282.08(b)); a PHOTOMETRICS PLAN REQUIRED BY SECTION 1276.14(a); AND IS ALSO MISSING OTHER AMENITIES.

3. THE DETAILED SITE PLAN SUBMITTED DOES NOT MATCH THE DISCUSSION PLAN APPROVED BY THE PLANNING COMMISSION ON JANUARY 14, 2016.

4. SECTION (A)(1)(C) OF THE "TYPE X BUILDINGS REQUIRES A MINIMUM 2,500 SQ. FT. CONFERENCE ROOM SEPARATE FROM THE INDOOR DINING AREA; THE CONFERENCE ROOM, AS SHOWN ON SHEET C1, HAS BEEN ELIMINATED ON THE SHEET C3 SITE PLAN AND T4 FLOOR PLAN.

5. SHEET C1 INDICATES THE DRIVEWAY TO BRUNSWICK LAKE APARTMENTS EXTENDING OFF THE EAST SIDE OF THE PROPOSED HOTEL PARKING LOT; SHEET C3 DOES NOT HAVE THE CORRECT LAYOUT. ADDITIONALLY, SHEET C4 SHOULD BE REMOVED FROM THE APPLICATION, AS THE PROPOSED BRIXMOR PARKING IMPROVEMENTS TO THE TOWN CENTER BOULEVARD BULB HAVE NOT BEEN APPROVED.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion.

Mr. Incorvaia explained, pursuant to Section 1278.03(e)(2), when a site plan is disapproved, it may not be resubmitted to the Planning Commission for review in less than one year from the date of the decision, unless correcting revisions have been made to the original plans.

The vote was 4 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 5

Regarding old business of a revised site plan for North Park Plaza, 3459 Center Road, Mr. Hank Rapport and Ms. Rhonda Singer, of Stark Enterprises, were present. Mr. Rapport stated the proposed plaza is 100% leased.

Mr. Rapport explained that eleven spaces are impacted by the retaining wall near Center Road and they could put bumper guards one foot away from the back of the space. Mr.

Shirilla said that would shorten the parking spaces by one foot; thus, making the spaces 17' long. Mr. Rapport said there is sufficient room for cars to park in these spaces and noted they will probably be used for employee parking.

Regarding the reduction in aisle width to 23' for the four rows of parking on the south side of the building, Mr. Jones said emergency vehicles can access through the site and there is no negative impact, to which Mr. Arona said he would be in favor of a modification, based on Mr. Jone's statement to this effect.

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE NORTH PARK PLAZA REVISED SITE PLAN, 3459 CENTER ROAD, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING:

1. THERE ARE TWENTY (20) PARKING SPACES ON THE **NORTH** SIDE OF THE SITE WITH AN 18' LENGTH; SECTION 1276.10(c) ALLOWS THAT NOT MORE THAN TWO FEET OF THE 19' STALL DEPTH REQUIRED BY TABLE 1276-3 MAY EXTEND ACROSS THE CURB OR BUMPER GUARD INTO AN UNPAVED OVERHANG AREA, PROVIDED THAT VEHICLES WILL NOT EXTEND ACROSS A PROPERTY LINE, RIGHT-OF-WAY LINE OR PUBLIC SIDEWALK; THEREFORE, THE 18' LENGTH IS SATISFACTORY.

   HOWEVER, DUE TO THE HEIGHT OF THE RETAINING WALL, THE **SOUTHERN** ELEVEN PARKING SPACES NEAR CENTER ROAD CANNOT OVERHANG AND SHALL BE ALLOWED TO HAVE AN 18' LENGTH. THE APPLICANT HAS STATED THEY WILL ADD BUMPER GUARDS BY THE ABOVE SPACES. THE PLANNING COMMISSION, PURSUANT TO SECTION 1276.15(b), MAY MODIFY THE SPECIFIC STANDARDS OF THIS CHAPTER AND APPROVE LESS RESTRICTIVE PARKING OR SITE DESIGN IMPROVEMENTS IN INDIVIDUAL, UNIQUE SITUATIONS WHERE SUCH STANDARDS ARE CLEARLY INAPPLICABLE. IN MODIFYING ANY REQUIREMENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE COMMISSION HAS FOUND THAT THE OBJECTIVES OF THIS CHAPTER, AS STATED IN SECTION 1276.01, HAVE BEEN MET, THAT THE INTENT OF THE SPECIFIC REQUIREMENT WILL BE MAINTAINED, AND THAT THE PUBLIC INTEREST WILL BE SERVED.

2. THE 23' AISLE WIDTH BETWEEN THE FOUR ROWS OF PARKING ON THE SOUTH SIDE OF THE BUILDING DOES NOT MEET THE 24' WIDTH REQUIRED BY TABLE 1276-3. THE PLANNING COMMISSION, PURSUANT TO SECTION 1276.15(b), AS STATED ABOVE, HAS GRANTED A MODIFICATION TO ALLOW A LESSER AISLE WIDTH AND HAS FOUND THAT THE OBJECTIVES OF THIS CHAPTER, AS STATED IN SECTION 1276.01, HAVE BEEN MET, THAT THE INTENT OF THE SPECIFIC REQUIREMENT WILL BE MAINTAINED, AND THAT THE PUBLIC INTEREST WILL BE SERVED.

3. THE CITY ENGINEER HAS REVIEWED THE EMERGENCY VEHICLE ACCESS ROUTE AND HAS DETERMINED IT IS NOT NEGATIVELY AFFECTED BY THE REDUCTION IN THE PARKING AISLE WIDTH AND PARKING SPACE LENGTH.

Mr. Arona seconded the motion. The vote was 3 Ayes 0 Nays 1 Abstain (Mr. Rocha).

Mr. Shirilla inquired who the tenants for North Park Plaza are; Mr. Rapport responded Starbucks, Hot Head Burritos, Pizza Fire, Dental One, Sprint, and Super Cuts. He said they hope to have the plaza open in early fall of 2017.

Item 6

Concerning new business, the Commission reviewed the 2017 Planning Commission meeting scheduled.

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO ADOPT THE 2017 PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING SCHEDULE.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 4 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 7

No one appeared at the public comment period.

Item 8

Mr. Ousley gave the Council Representative's Report. He said the next Planning & Zoning Committee meeting will be on December 15, 2016 at 6:00 p.m. and invited the Commission to attend to discuss future development in the city.

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 4 Ayes 0 Nays.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:30 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

November 17, 2016

Bullseye Activewear & Promotions addition
(Discussion site plan)

Location: 2947 Nationwide Parkway
I-L District

Proposed Use & Background:
An application has been submitted to construct a 4,160 sq. ft. addition (80' x 52') on the north side of the existing 6,536 sq. ft. building, for a total of 10,696 sq. ft. There are 22 parking spaces which meet the minimum 7 spaces required by Table 1276-1(e).

The 25' side and rear yard setbacks have been maintained, pursuant to Section 1266.05(d) and (e), respectively. The existing building will be covered with metal siding to match the new addition.

Staff Review Comments:
1. The parking space dimensions are indicated at 10' x 18' long; Section 1276.10(c) allows that not more than two feet of the 19' stall depth required by Table 1276-3 may extend across the curb or bumper guard into an unpaved overhang area, provided that vehicles will not extend across a property line, right-of-way line or public sidewalk. The 7 spaces on the west side of the building will need to be extended to a 19' length.
2. The detailed site plan shall indicate that gutters and downspouts for the proposed addition shall tie into a public storm sewer, as required by Section 304.7.1 of the Property Maintenance Code.
3. Performance Standards, pursuant to Section 1266.07, shall be submitted with the detailed site plan.
4. A photometrics plan, in compliance with Section 1276.14(a), shall be submitted with the detailed site plan indicating a minimum 0.6 footcandle lighting level for parking and pedestrian areas.

Staff Recommendations:
Staff recommends moving the discussion plan to a detailed site plan provided the above items are addressed.

Comfort Inn & Suites (former Wallhouse Hotel)
(Detailed site plan)

Location: 1464 Town Center Boulevard
Southeast Neighborhood, Brunswick Town Center SPD-2

Proposed Use & Background:
A detailed site plan has been submitted for the proposed hotel in the Southeast Neighborhood of Brunswick Town Center SPD-2. The Planning Commission approved the revised façade elevation on June 4, 2015 and moved the revised discussion plan to a detailed site plan at their meeting on January 14, 2016.

Per the Planning Commission's request on May 7, 2015, the January 14, 2016 revised discussion plan indicates the northern access on Brunswick Lake Parkway has been eliminated and redirected toward Giant Eagle's north/south driveway by the pharmacy. Additionally, the previously shown curb cut on Brunswick Lake Parkway has been removed, along with the existing curb cut on the Town Center Boulevard bulb. This plan also depicts the access drive to the Brunswick Lake Apartments will extend from the northeast side of the hotel parking lot, instead of the southeast curb cut on the end of the Town Center Boulevard bulb.

The hotel will now accommodate 82 rooms; 72 rooms were proposed on the original discussion plan dated May 7, 2015. The plan indicates 105 parking spaces, including 6 handicap spaces (4 van-accessible) and 99 regular spaces, in compliance with the minimum 89 spaces required by Table 1276-1(d)(8) of the Zoning Code and Table 1106 of the 2011 Ohio Building Code. The parking spaces measure 9' x 19' and a 24' parking aisle width is provided, in compliance with Table 1276-3.

The façade of the hotel will consist of red brick with cast stone decorative block in a color to be determined, as Section D(1)(b) of the "Type X Buildings" requires the use of enduring materials. Cornices are shown along the roofline, pursuant to Section D(4)(b) of the above guidelines. A covered entrance is shown on the north side of the hotel and a patio is indicated on the south side. Pedestrian sidewalks have been provided, as required by Section 1278.09(d). Service areas have been screened by means of a vinyl privacy fence, in accordance with Section (E) of "Type X Buildings", and a dumpster is proposed at the southeast corner of the site.

Staff Review Comments:

1. The hotel shall be constructed in accordance with the "Type X Buildings: Hotel" in the Brunswick Town Center SPD-2 Design Guidelines for the Southeast Neighborhood.
2. The conference room, as shown on Sheet C1, has been eliminated on the Sheet C3 site plan and T4 floor plan; Section (A)(1)(c) of the "Type X Buildings" requires a minimum 2,500 sq. ft. conference room separate from the indoor dining area.
3. Sheet C1 indicates the driveway to Brunswick Lake Apartments extending off the east side of the proposed hotel parking lot; Sheet C3 does not have the correct layout.
4. Three easements extend through the property: 20' wide Columbia Gas of Ohio pipeline and ingress/egress easement; 20' wide Medina County sanitary sewer easement; and 50' wide City of Cleveland – Division of Water easement that shall be relocated.
5. A photometrics plan shall be submitted, pursuant to Section 1276.14(a), indicating a minimum lighting level of 0.6 footcandle for parking and pedestrian areas.
6. Although enduring materials have been used on the building façade, this is a departure from the façade approved by the Planning Commission on June 4, 2015. Additionally, a color rendering shall be provided.
7. Section 1282.08(a) requires a minimum 5' wide parking perimeter landscaping strip with materials from Plant List "D" or "E" that will achieve a decorative planting with a

minimum height of 4'; this has not been provided along the north, south, and east parking lots.

8. Verify there is a minimum of 2,100 sq. ft. of interior landscaping, pursuant to Section 1282.08(b). The minimum of 7 trees from Plant List "A" has been met, as required by Section 1282.08(b)(2), but the minimum of 56 shrubs has not been provided.
9. The address on the site plans should be changed to the correct address of 1464 Town Center Boulevard.
10. The detailed site plan submitted does not match the discussion plan approved by the Planning Commission on January 14, 2016.

Staff Recommendations:
Staff withholds recommendation until the above items are addressed.

Stark Enterprises revised site plan
(Revised site plan)

Location: 3459 Center Road (former First Merit Bank)
C-G District

Proposed Use & Background:
Due to utility placement issues, a revised site plan has been submitted indicating a parking stall length of 18' for the 11 spaces on the south side of the site and 20 spaces on the north side of the site. The applicant is also requesting to reduce the aisle width between the rows of parking to 23' feet, instead of the 24' required by Table 1276-3, on the south side of the building. The Planning Commission approved the detailed site plan and façade elevations on July 21 and 28, 2016.

Staff Review Comments:

4. Section 1276.10(c) allows that not more than two feet of the 19' stall depth required by Table 1276-3 may extend across the curb or bumper guard into an unpaved overhang area, provided that vehicles will not extend across a property line, right-of-way line or public sidewalk; therefore, the 18' length is satisfactory on the north and south sides of the site.
5. The 23' aisle width between the rows of parking on the south side of the building does not meet the 24' width required by Table 1276-3. The Planning Commission, pursuant to Section 1276.15(b), may modify the specific standards of this Chapter and approve less restrictive parking or site design improvements in individual, unique situations where such standards are clearly inapplicable. In modifying any requirement of this Chapter, the Commission shall find that the objectives of this Chapter, as stated in Section 1276.01, will be met, that the intent of the specific requirement will be maintained, and that the public interest will be served. The concurring vote of three members of the Planning Commission shall be required to approve a less restrictive improvement.
6. Verify emergency vehicle access isn't negatively affected by the reduction in the parking aisle width and parking space length.

7. Indicate the location of the retaining wall to ensure it will not impact vehicle overhang on the parking spaces.

Staff Recommendations:
Staff recommends approval of the revised site plan, subject to engineering approval and a determination of a modification by the Planning Commission.