

Brunswick City Planning Commission

March 16, 2017 – Caucus

7:00 p.m.

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Nick Hanek, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Eric Andrews, USA Management, 35110 Euclid Avenue,
Willoughby

Vice Chairman Jeff Arona called the meeting to order at 7:09 p.m.

The first item was the review of the public hearing for the 303 Laser Wash conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan, 3901 Center Road (former Ponderosa site). Mr. Jones said the new project, as planned, is violating the riparian setback, but this is an existing site. He commented the new laser wash is reducing the amount of hard surface area and the structure is outside of the riparian setback. Mr. Arona asked if there is a concern about trees and grass located in the floodplain; Mr. Jones responded no, the trees help absorb the water.

Chairman Shirilla arrived at 7:13 p.m.

The second item was the discussion of the site plan for the Martin Properties II Ltd. parking lot modification, 2888 Nationwide Parkway. Ms. Plavecski informed the Commission that the applicant asked for the project to be continued until the April 20, 2017 meeting, in order to prepare a new discussion plan showing the proposed addition.

The third item was old business of the Zeppe's Tavern detailed site plan, 1733 Pearl Road (Laurel Square Shopping Center). Mr. Jones commented the construction of the new building fulfills breaking up the existing "sea of asphalt" in the parking lot. Mr. Arona suggested extending the shrubbery to the corner of Pearl and Laurel Roads.

Mr. Shirilla adjourned the meeting at 7:35 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

Brunswick City Planning Commission

March 16, 2017

7:30 p.m.

Joe Shirilla, Chairman
Jeff Arona, Vice Chairman
John Rocha, Recording Secretary
Abbas Hasan, Member
Brad Saeger, Member
Nick Hanek, Council Representative
Matt Jones, Consulting City Engineer
Pamela Plavecski, Planning & Zoning Coordinator
Santo Incorvaia, Assistant Law Director
Jim Samuels, 160 Murwood Drive, Moreland Hills
Michael Molchan, Makovich & Pusti, 111 Front Street, Berea
Scott Bagi, 34063 Henwell Road, Columbia Station
Eric Andrews, USA Management, 35110 Euclid Avenue,
Willoughby

Item 1

Chairman Joe Shirilla called the meeting to order at 7:40 p.m.

Item 2

Regarding announcements or correspondence, Ms. Plavecski announced the applicant for the Martin Properties II Ltd. parking lot modification, 2888 Nationwide Parkway, requested the item to be tabled until the Planning Commission's April 20, 2017 agenda.

Item 3

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF MARCH 2, 2017.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 4 Ayes 0 Nays 1 Abstain (Mr. Shirilla).

Item 4(a)

Regarding the public hearing for the 303 Laser Wash conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan, 3901 Center Road (former Ponderosa site), Mr. Scott Bagi, owner; and Mr. Michael Molchan, of Makovich & Pusti, were present.

Mr. Jones explained a portion of the site is located within the riparian setback of the former Gary Ditch. He said they are removing 20% of the existing hard surface and noted the laser wash building is not located within the riparian setback. He said he is in favor of this project as the applicant is improving an existing situation. Mr. Jones asked if he has the authority to approve a project where the parking is located in the riparian setback; Mr. Incorvaia confirmed that he does, pursuant to Chapter 1236 and Chapter 1238 of the Codified Ordinances.

Mr. Molchan addressed the Staff Review Comments as follows:

1. They will change the "Autumn Brilliance Apple Serviceberry" caliper to 2-1/2", as required by Section 1282.04(b)(1), instead of a 1-1/2" caliper.
2. They will add calculations to the Landscaping Plan verifying that a minimum of 10% of the total front yard area not used for parking or circulation shall be landscaped with trees, shrubs, planting beds, and/or front yard landscaping in a design selected by the owner, pursuant to Sections 1282.06(e).
3. They will also add calculations to the landscaping plan indicating the amount of interior landscaping provided; Section 1282.08(a) requires a minimum of 160 sq. ft.

Mr. Hasan inquired if the wall sign on the front of the building changed; Mr. Molchan responded yes, it was reduced slightly when they added the wall sconces.

Mr. Arona asked if there are any concerns about planting evergreens and grass in the flood plain on the north side of the landscape buffer; Mr. Jones replied that planting trees aids in absorbing the water and Mr. Molchan said the site is located in a 100-year flood plain. Mr. Shirilla questioned if there will be any mounding where the trees are being planted. Mr. Molchan answered there will be no mounding, but the double row of evergreens will be slightly elevated.

Mr. Shirilla declared the public hearing open; no one appeared, so he declared it closed.

MR. ARONA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE CONDITIONAL ZONING CERTIFICATE AND DETAILED SITE PLAN FOR THE 303 LASER WASH, 3901 CENTER ROAD, SUBJECT TO THE APPLICANT'S COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF REVIEW COMMENTS 1 THROUGH 3 AS FOLLOWS:

1. THE "AUTUMN BRILLIANCE APPLE SERVICEBERRY" SHALL BE INDICATED WITH A MINIMUM CALIPER OF AT LEAST 2-1/2", PURSUANT TO SECTION 1282.04(b)(1).
2. CALCULATIONS SHALL BE ADDED TO THE LANDSCAPING PLAN VERIFYING THAT A MINIMUM OF 10% OF THE TOTAL FRONT YARD AREA NOT USED FOR PARKING OR CIRCULATION SHALL BE LANDSCAPED WITH TREES, SHRUBS, PLANTING BEDS, AND/OR FRONT YARD LANDSCAPING IN A DESIGN SELECTED BY THE OWNER, PURSUANT TO SECTIONS 1282.06(e).

3. CALCULATIONS SHALL ALSO BE ADDED TO THE LANDSCAPING PLAN INDICATING THE AMOUNT OF INTERIOR LANDSCAPING PROVIDED; SECTION 1282.08(a) REQUIRES A MINIMUM OF 160 SQ. FT.
4. FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL IS SUBJECT TO ENGINEERING APPROVAL, INCLUDING THE REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF STORMWATER MANAGEMENT AND ANY RIPARIAN ISSUES.

Mr. Hasan seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 4(b)

Concerning the site plan review for the Martin II Ltd. parking lot modification, 2888 Nationwide Parkway, Ms. Plavecski explained the applicant requested the project to be tabled until April 20, 2017, in order to have sufficient time to draft a conceptual plan showing the proposed addition.

MR. SHIRILLA MOTIONED TO TABLE, AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST, THE MARTIN II LTD. PARKING LOT MODIFICATION, 2888 NATIONWIDE PARKWAY, UNTIL THE PLANNING COMMISSION'S APRIL 20, 2017 MEETING.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Item 5

Regarding old business of Zeppe's Tavern, 1733 Pearl Road (Laurel Square Shopping Center), Mr. Eric Andrews, of USA Management, was present.

Mr. Jones read a statement from Grant Aungst, Community & Economic Development Director for the City of Brunswick, who was unable to attend tonight's meeting. Mr. Aungst stated construction of the new building would reduce the visual "sea of asphalt" and the owner has put in over \$1 million in facade improvements. He noted there is an existing covered walkway at the Laurel Square Shopping Center, which is part of a pedestrian amenity required by Section 1260.07(e)(1) of the Zoning Code. Mr. Aungst commented it would be a financial hardship to ask the plaza owner to provide interior landscaping, who will be seeking a modification. He said the community has been requesting a new sit-down restaurant and he expressed his support for this project.

Mr. Jones also noted Zeppe's Tavern will bring in 150 new jobs, of which 40 to 45 jobs will be full-time. He commented that the building itself is breaking up the existing "sea of asphalt", pursuant to Section 1260.07(d)(2), both visually and physically.

Mr. Andrews commented they agree that adding landscaping would satisfy the code, but they can't put it in, as the maintenance costs are high. He explained they added a 2' high decorative fence and moved the building back 5' in order to add two pedestrian benches in

front of the building. Mr. Andrews stated they also added one bench by the Pearl Road sidewalk.

Mr. Shirilla suggested eliminating the 2' high fence and landscaping in front of the building and relocating the landscaping to the curve on Pearl and Laurel Roads to provide a focal point. Mr. Hasan and Mr. Arona concurred with this idea. Mr. Incorvaia said as Zeppe's Tavern is not an outlot, the landscaping could be moved, as it would be adjacent to a row of parking that is not designated for a particular business in the shopping center. He stated this would fulfill the required Pearl Road 10' wide landscaping strip, pursuant to Section 1282.06(g). Mr. Shirilla also commented the bench by the Pearl Road sidewalk could be eliminated, as it is not practical.

Mr. Andrews stated they will not be adding any foundation landscaping in front of the building, as Zeppe's Tavern will not maintain it. He said they will add two planters in front of the building. Mr. Arona noted there are two large areas of concrete at the northwest and southwest corners of the building near the parking lot and suggested adding interior landscaping in those areas. Mr. Andrews said he doesn't want to do that because the plants will die, due to no one maintaining them, and these areas will be filled with cigarette butts. Mr. Shirilla said Zeppe's Tavern employees can water the plants; it doesn't require much time or effort. He stated to reduce the amount of interior landscaping from 3,860 sq. ft. to zero is very extreme. Mr. Hasan suggested adding planters in the northwest and southwest concrete islands near the parking lot.

Mr. Shirilla commented a landscaping plan is required showing the above improvements. Mr. Arona suggested adding one planter and one bench in front of each pier on the front of the building, along with adding planters on the northwest and southwest concrete pads.

Mr. Shirilla summarized the proposed landscaping plan as follows:

1. Eliminate the fence and landscaping in front of Zeppe's Tavern, and re-locate the landscaping further south to the corner of Pearl and Laurel Roads to provide a focal point. Additionally, eliminate the bench by the Pearl Road sidewalk.
2. Add one planter and one bench in front of each pier by the front of the building, for a total of two planters and two benches.
3. Add one planter each on the northwest and southwest concrete islands near the front of the building containing a mixture of annual seasonal flowers and perennial greenery.
4. Install nineteen (19) arborvitae shrubs 3' to 4' high on the outside patio and increase the patio fence height to 6'. He noted a modification, pursuant to Section 1282.10(a), will be required for the proposed interior landscaping, as it does not meet the minimum 3,860 sq. ft. required by Section 1282.08(b).

Ms. Plavecski commented the architect needs to provide the percentage and length of projections or recesses on the Pearl Road street façade; Section 1260.07(a) requires that street facades greater than 60' in length (building measures 86'4") shall incorporate one or more wall plane projections or recesses having a minimum depth of at least 3% (2.59') and extending at least 20% (17.26') of the length of the street façade.

Mr. Saeger noted the site plan doesn't reflect the current parking on the site. He stated there are no spaces behind or to the south of the building, but the number of spaces does meet code. He said he wants to see the photometrics plan for all of the parking, or, the parking behind the building should be eliminated on the site plan. Mr. Saeger commented regarding the 11 parking places near Fat Bob's Pizza/Mr. Hero, that six handicap parking spaces have been removed and reduced to three spaces, and wanted to ensure the number complies with the Ohio Building Code requirements. Mr. Jones stated he will check this during the engineering review process.

Mr. Hasan noted that three landscape islands containing a total of three trees are being eliminated when Zeppe's Tavern is constructed.

As Mr. Shirilla wanted to confer with the Assistant Law Director, a 5-minute recess was requested.

MR. SAEGER MOTIONED TO HAVE A 5-MINUTE RECESS.

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

The meeting was recessed at 9:15 p.m.

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO RECONVENE THE MEETING.

Mr. Arona seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

The meeting was reconvened at 9:20 p.m.

Mr. Shirilla suggested making a motion on the three modifications needed to the front yard setback, front yard parking zone width, and that 2/3's of the building must be located within the required front yard setback. He further suggested the applicant should return at a future meeting with a complete detailed site plan including a revised landscape plan and photometrics plan containing the items discussed tonight.

MR. HASAN MOTIONED TO GRANT A MODIFICATION FOR ZEPPE'S TAVERN, 1733 LAUREL ROAD (LAUREL SQUARE SHOPPING CENTER) TO ALLOW THE FRONT YARD SETBACK TO BE LOCATED 93'5" FROM THE PEARL ROAD RIGHT-OF-WAY, WHICH EXCEEDS THE MAXIMUM 75' FRONT YARD SETBACK PERMITTED BY SECTION 1260.05(a)(2)(A). ADDITIONALLY, THE FRONT YARD PARKING ZONE WIDTH EXCEEDS THE MAXIMUM 45' WIDTH PERMITTED BY SECTION 1260.07(b), AND 2/3'S OF THE STREET FAÇADE DOES NOT FALL WITHIN THE FRONT YARD ZONE, AS REQUIRED BY SECTION 1260.07(a).

IN ACCORDANCE WITH SECTION 1260.07(c)(3), THE PLANNING COMMISSION MAY APPROVE FRONT YARD OR FRONT YARD PARKING ZONE WIDTHS GREATER THAN THE MAXIMUM AND THE COMMISSION HAS FOUND THAT THE APPLICANT HAS

DEMONSTRATED TO THE SATISFACTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION THAT MORE FRONT YARD PARKING THAN A SINGLE LOADED BAY IS NECESSARY BECAUSE OF THE UNIQUE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE BUSINESS OR SITE.

PURSUANT TO SECTION 1260.07(d), BEFORE APPROVING A FRONT YARD OR FRONT YARD PARKING ZONE WIDTH GREATER THAN THE MAXIMUM, THE PLANNING COMMISSION HAS FOUND:

- (1) THAT THE OBJECTIVES OF THE PEARL AND CENTER ROAD CORRIDOR PLAN WILL BE MET, INCLUDING THE VISION, GOALS AND PREFERRED CHARACTERISTICS IN CHAPTER 3 OF THE CORRIDOR PLAN; AND
- (2) THAT THE NEGATIVE EFFECTS OF GREATER BUILDING YARDS, INCLUDING WITHOUT LIMITATION, THE IMPAIRMENT OF PEDESTRIAN ACTIVITY AND STREETSCAPES VISUALLY DEFINED BY A "SEA OF ASPHALT" WILL BE OUTWEIGHED BY REQUIRED LANDSCAPING AND OTHER REQUIRED SITE AMENITIES AS PROVIDED BELOW IN SUBSECTION (e).

AS REQUIRED BY SECTION 1260.07(e)(1), WHERE THE PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVES A FRONT YARD OR FRONT YARD PARKING ZONE WIDTH EXCEEDING THE MAXIMUM, THE COMMISSION, AS PART OF ITS FINDINGS, HAS REQUIRED THAT PEDESTRIAN AMENITIES SHALL BE INSTALLED TO CREATE A PHYSICAL AND DESIGN LINKAGE WITH THE STREET, INCLUDING, WITHOUT LIMITATION, PLAZAS, BENCHES, BIKE RACKS AND LANDSCAPED OR COVERED WALKWAYS.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Mr. Incorvaia noted action needs to be taken on the detailed site plan tonight as approval time will be expiring. Mr. Andrews requested to table the detailed site plan.

MR. SAEGER MOTIONED TO TABLE, AT THE APPLICANT'S REQUEST, THE DETAILED SITE PLAN FOR ZEPPE'S TAVERN, 1733 PEARL ROAD (LAUREL SQUARE SHOPPING CENTER).

Mr. Rocha seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

Mr. Jones noted, as stated at the March 2, 2017 meeting, that there is an issue with the angled parking on the north side of the building; the 60° angled parking spaces need to have a 21' length and one-way aisle width of 18', pursuant to Table 1276-3.

Item 6

There was no new business.

Item 7

No one appeared at the public comment period.

Item 8

Mr. Hanek gave the Council Representative's Report. He stated the moratorium to review plans for the Comfort Suites hotel will end on April 12th. Ms. Plavecski said the hotel will probably be on the Commission's April 20, 2017 agenda. Mr. Hanek noted said the Safety Levy will be on the May 2nd ballot.

MR. ROCHA MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING.

Mr. Saeger seconded the motion. The vote was 5 Ayes 0 Nays.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:43 p.m.

Respectfully,

Pamela Plavecski

PLANNING COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

March 16, 2017

303 Laser Wash

(Public hearing – conditional zoning certificate & detailed site plan)

Location: 3901 Center Road
C-G District

Proposed Use & Background:

A conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan have been submitted to construct a 2-story 4,834 sq. ft. laser wash facility consisting of three bays, office area, and equipment room on the first floor measuring 4,140 sq. ft.; and office/storage space on the second floor measuring 694 sq. ft. The Planning Commission moved the discussion plan to a detailed site plan at their meeting on January 19, 2017.

As a car wash is not listed as a permitted or conditionally permitted use in the C-G General Commercial District, the Commission, at their meeting on April 7, 2016, along with City Council at their meeting on May 9, 2016, approved a comparable use determination of a car wash to an automobile filling station, which is a conditionally permitted use in the C-G District, pursuant to Section 1260.04(j), subject to Sections 1274.08(d), (f), and (g), and Section 1274.13 of the Zoning Code.

The applicant addressed the Staff Review Comments and Commission's suggestions from the January 19th meeting as follows:

1. The landscape plan indicates a double staggered row of trees from Plant List "C" including a combination of 6-ft. high White Fir, Norway Spruce, and Colorado Spruce be used in the 25' wide landscape screening yard on the north side of the site, pursuant to Section 1282.06(a). Additionally, there is an existing wooded area that will remain undisturbed to provide further screening in that area. Plant materials have been identified for the 10' wide landscape buffer along the east property line.
2. The landscape plan indicates there is an existing tree line which meets the minimum 5' wide parking perimeter screening yard required on the west side of the site adjacent to the four parking spaces, pursuant to Section 1282.08(a). Also, there is a creek (flood zone) located in this area.
3. A photometrics plan has been submitted with the detailed site plan indicating a minimum 0.6 footcandle lighting level for parking and pedestrian areas, in accordance with Section 1276.14(a). Lighting levels along the north property line adjacent to Cross Creek Apartments do not exceed 1.0 footcandle, pursuant to Section 1276.14(d). The average lighting level is 0.7 footcandle, in compliance with the 2.4 maximum permitted by Section 1276.14(c)

4. Pavement striping for pedestrian access, as required by Section 1278.09(b), has been added leading to the vacuum islands from the main building for use of the coin change machine and vending machines.
5. The detailed site plan indicates pavement arrow designations and proper signage for the Center Road eastern drive indicating "Entrance Only/No Exit" and for the western drive indicating dedicated right-turn and left-turn "Exit Only" lanes.
6. Additional brick detail in the form of Corbel split-faced concrete masonry units (CMU) and 1" soldier course block at all corners has been added for architectural enhancement. Furthermore, as suggested by the Planning Commission, five sconces have been added to the front (south) façade, and two sconces have been added to the west elevation near the coin changing and vending machines.

Staff Review Comments:

4. The "Autumn Brilliance Apple Serviceberry" is shown with a 1-1/2" caliper; Section 1282.04(b)(1) requires a minimum caliper of at least 2-1/2".
5. Calculations shall be added to the Landscaping Plan verifying that a minimum of 10% of the total front yard area not used for parking or circulation shall be landscaped with trees, shrubs, planting beds, and/or front yard landscaping in a design selected by the owner, pursuant to Sections 1282.06(e).
6. Calculations shall also be added to the landscaping plan indicating the amount of interior landscaping provided; Section 1282.08(a) requires a minimum of 160 sq. ft.

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends approval of the conditional zoning certificate and detailed site plan, provided the above items are addressed.

Martin Properties II Ltd.

(Parking lot modification)

Location: 2888 Nationwide Parkway
I-L District

Proposed Use & Background:

The applicant is seeking a modification to allow a gravel parking lot to remain for a period of two years that was installed approximately in June of 2016 without benefit of Planning Commission, Engineering, or Division of Building approvals or permits. The applicant has stated they are contemplating the construction of a building addition that would be erected directly over the majority of the gravel area that is required to be paved. The applicant also wishes to allow temporary use of the gravel parking lot by Brunswick Auto Mart for off-site parking of excess automobile inventory.

Staff Review Comments:

1. Section 1276.10(c) states that all parking areas, driveways and aprons, shall be paved according to specifications approved by the City Engineer, based on subgrade conditions and traffic loads. Bumper guards or curbs shall be required at the perimeter of parking lots and in other necessary locations to define the limits of paved areas designated for parking.
2. A stand-alone parking lot is not a permitted or conditionally permitted use in the I-L District, pursuant to Sections 1266.02 and 1266.04 of the Zoning Code. Section 1266.03(b) states accessory uses clearly incidental to the permitted or conditionally permitted uses on the same premises are allowed.
3. The applicant has stated according to a stormwater management study of the property performed by Bramhall Engineering in late summer/early fall of 2016, the existing gravel parking lot creates a burden on the existing storm sewer system. As a result, a conceptual detention basin stormwater management plan was presented to city staff. A comprehensive stormwater management plan for the site shall be submitted, which was due when the land was cleared in 2015.
4. Submit a conceptual plan for the proposed future wing to the existing building.
5. Pursuant to Section 1276.15(b), the Planning Commission may modify the specific standards of this Chapter and approve less restrictive parking or site design improvements in individual, unique situations where such standards are clearly inapplicable. In modifying any requirement of this Chapter, the Commission shall find that the objectives of this Chapter, as stated in Section 1276.01, will be met, that the intent of the specific requirement will be maintained and that the public interest will be served. The concurring vote of three members of the Planning Commission shall be required to approve a less restrictive improvement.

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends denial of the gravel parking lot and to deny off-site parking of vehicles on the lot, as this is not permitted by Sections 1276.10(c), 1266.02, and 1266.04, respectively, of the Zoning Code.